

**Children's Aesthetic Understanding:
Developing Interpretations of Photography**

Amy Cannon

Park Forest Elementary School Annex, Intern

Kindergarten

Amc311@psu.edu

May 7, 2005

ABSTRACT

Recent studies have documented the stages of aesthetic development through which individuals progress. In this study, children's aesthetic development is explored through the use of photography. Several overarching questions fuel this study. How do individuals develop an appreciation for art? What specific experiences have an impact on this process? Can the experiences be linked to formal (school) or informal (family, museum) contexts? Connections are made between children's priorities at different stages of aesthetic development and their preferences when creating and rating photographs. The most consistent qualitative results of the present study suggest that students in a Photography Production class progress through the stages of aesthetic understanding, whereas those in either a Photography Appreciation class or in a class with regular art curriculum maintain the same level of aesthetic understanding.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES.....	v
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	vi
INTRODUCTION.....	1
Parsons' Stages of Aesthetic Development.....	1
Housen's Stages of Aesthetic Development.....	4
Visual Memory, Perception and Spatial Cognition.....	5
Use of Photography to Discern Aesthetic Development.....	8
METHOD.....	10
Participants.....	10
Materials.....	10
Procedure.....	11
RESULTS AND DISCUSSION.....	16
Classroom Narratives from the Fifth-grade Photography Appreciation Class.....	16
Students' Explanations of Rating Responses.....	20
REFERENCES.....	38
APPENDIX A: Fifth-grade - Photography Appreciation Lesson Plan, Day 1.....	39
APPENDIX B: Fifth-grade - Photography Appreciation Lesson Plan, Day 2.....	42
APPENDIX C: Fifth-grade - Photography Appreciation Lesson Plan, Day 3.....	45
APPENDIX D: Fifth-grade - Photography Production Lesson Plan, Day 1.....	48
APPENDIX E: Fifth-grade - Photography Production Lesson Plan, Day 2.....	52
APPENDIX F: Fifth-grade - Photography Production Lesson Plan, Day 3.....	54
APPENDIX G: Second-grade - Photography Production Lesson Plan, Day 1.....	57

APPENDIX H: Second-grade - Photography Production Lesson Plan, Day 2.....	60
APPENDIX I: Second-grade - Photography Production Lesson Plan, Day 3.....	63
APPENDIX J: Fifth-grade Rating Instructions and Sheet.....	66
APPENDIX K: First- and Second-grade Rating Instructions and Sheet Sample.....	71
APPENDIX L: “Reasons” Interview with First- and Second-grade Children.....	75
APPENDIX M: Academic Vita of Amy Cannon.....	77

LIST OF TABLES

1. Fifth-grade Procedure.....	12
2. First- and Second-grade Procedure.....	13
3. Fifth-grade Photography Production Class: Student Explanations.....	21
4. Second-grade Photography Production Class: Student Explanations.....	24
5. Fifth-grade Photography Appreciation Class: Student Explanations.....	28
6. Fifth-grade Control Class: Student Explanations.....	31
7. First- and Second-grade Control Class: Student Explanations.....	33

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am deeply grateful for the support and enthusiasm that my supervisor Lynn Liben has extended through teaching, encouraging, and motivating me in countless meaningful ways. She has inspired me to value the intellectual growth that occurs only through embracing challenges. I am thankful for the logistical and artistic classroom input of Melanie Fink. For their effort in the project, I thank the first-, second-, and fifth-grade students. For encouragement and flexibility, I thank Deborah Patrick. Sincere thanks to Lauren Myers, Jennifer Lyons, Jenna Haley and Libby Sultzbaugh for entering and coding the data. I thank Lauren Myers, Mardi McDonough and my mother, Lizabeth Cannon for interviewing the students. For his feedback and encouragement, I thank my father, Frederick Cannon.

Introduction

Art, expressed through various forms, is a foundational and invaluable aspect of society. Art surrounds and inhabits the choices that individuals make every day; choosing a clothing ensemble, selecting a decorative floral arrangement, preferring certain wall adornments, all require conscious artistic decisions. The purpose of art in our lives remains central to the process of making artistic choices.

We typically depend on art to provide beauty, expressiveness, style, and formal qualities. Our increasingly sophisticated understandings of the various components directly contribute to our aesthetic development (Parsons, 1987).

Parsons' Stages of Aesthetic Development

Parsons characterizes the quest to understand aesthetic experience as a field that draws from several theories including those from psychology, philosophy, art, and education. Though the field of aesthetic understanding does not strictly belong to any single discipline, its harmony lies in its focus on how individuals come to make sense of art.

Parsons' five stages of aesthetic development provide the underpinning for understanding artistic growth. From interviewing individuals, ranging from pre-school to adult, about their responses to various paintings, Parsons identified five successive stages in aesthetic development. Stage one is characterized by favoritism, stage two emphasizes beauty and realism, stage three is dominated by expressiveness, stage four embarks on a deeper understanding of style and form, and stage five concludes the sequence with autonomy.

When critiquing any artwork, there are several artistic elements to consider. Among these, subject, expression, medium, form, and style each contribute significantly to the overall effect of the work. Parsons emphasizes each of these aspects throughout the five different stages.

Viewers in stage one, favoritism, recognize that paintings have meaning. They are not, however, aware of how an artwork's significance is different from those meanings in maps and alphabets. They focus on the artwork's appeal, but they are oblivious to whether the artwork itself can hold unique expression.

During stage two, beauty and realism, viewers anticipate that beautiful or fascinating physical objects will be pictured in paintings. The spectator prefers to view realistic subjects which have been created with care and precision. A stage-two viewer differentiates between personal feelings and those represented in the artwork. When identifying a personal reaction to the artwork, stage-two viewers might intentionally avoid their gut reactions. In place of their authentic feelings, they adopt and accept what they think is the conventional response.

By the time viewers reach stage three, expressiveness, they are aware that the subject has abstract characteristics. They recognize that a painting may not directly picture its subject, though it may be about something specific. Thus, stage-three viewers welcome a broad spectrum of artwork, as their preference is not limited solely to realistic or beautiful works.

Stage-three viewers develop an appreciation for individual analysis and value their unique response. This process is essential, as the viewers become aware of their personal reactions. Through these new acknowledgements, layers of the inner self develop, and viewers discover new potentials for sentiment and outlook. Due to the

emphasis on esteeming their private response to the artwork, they do not consider the connection between the artist's intent and the outcome of the artwork.

When viewers have progressed to stage four, style and form, they begin to consider technique; they are aware that the subject is closely intertwined with medium and formal arrangement. A stage four understanding of photographs would consider how the technical production and composition would have an impact on its subject.

Just as stage-four viewers refine their analysis of the artwork through viewing the whole composition, so too, these viewers consider the comprehensive response of others. In an effort to interpret the artwork, these viewers weigh and consider all insights. Social interaction and discourse stimulate deeper comprehension and analysis. As viewers notice new relationships and interpretations, the artwork takes on more meaningful forms. Parsons elaborates: "This suggests that the significance of a painting, if it is at all complex, is more than the conscious content of our mind at any one time. It is rather what can be publicly articulated in a discursive and serial way, and is always subject to change in light of what others may say later" (Parsons, 1987, p. 84).

Soon following this recognition, in stage five, autonomy, the subject inspires viewers to question and reevaluate their perceptions and values. The artwork is more than merely a statement; it also stimulates interpersonal and intrapersonal questions. In this way, by the time viewers reach the fifth stage, they interact with the artwork on a personal level. The artwork adds to and challenges their previously developed perceptions, categories, and values. In this stage, through a clarifying and revealing process, the art itself purposes to make their inner thoughts and dispositions evident to themselves and others.

Housen's Stages of Aesthetic Development

Housen developed a similar five-stage model of aesthetic understanding (1983). She initially interacted with museum gallery viewers, cataloguing their reactions. Later, through conducting open-ended interviews, termed the Aesthetic Development Interview (ADI), she classified individuals' responses to artwork into categories. The interviews centered on two questions: (1) What is going on here? (2) What do you see that makes you say that? Through analyzing the responses, Housen identified the stages of aesthetic development.

Viewers in stage one, the accountive stage, interact with the artwork on a narrative level. Viewers develop personal connections to the image and use these connections to tell a story about the image. As viewers are reminded of their connection to the image, they maintain their initial interpretations of the text. Though new meanings may unfold while engaging with the artwork through narratives, the viewers' interpretations are not dynamic in nature.

Viewers in stage two, the constructive stage, primarily concern themselves with logical arrangements and evidence of skill. The artwork loses value if it represents something in an unusual manner. Detached from personal emotion, viewers begin to consider the artist's original intentions.

In stage three, the classifying stage, viewers develop connections among the historical and factual aspects of the artwork. Assuming the role of an art historian, viewers analyze and critique the work through a scholarly lens. Enthusiastic to share their ever expanding knowledge, viewers seek a sensible and supportable message.

Viewers in stage four, the interpretative stage, are patient, contemplative viewers. These viewers anticipate dynamic interaction with the work. Through focusing on

emotional reactions, viewers seek new insight from the work. Viewers' emotions gradually transform, and thus, their interpretations are subject to change.

In the fifth and final stage, the re-creative stage, viewers connect with the work on two levels. Though on one level, viewers are intimate with the work, it simultaneously raises new questions. Thus, levels of personal familiarity and universal awareness intertwine; viewers reach an apex of aesthetic sophistication.

In order to reach an aesthetic understanding at stage five, individuals must progress naturally through each prior stage. The framework for each next step in aesthetic development depends on a thorough and complete progression through experiences mastered in the previous stage.

Visual Memory, Perception, and Spatial Cognition

Throughout this process, children's aesthetic development relates significantly to three areas that Gardner (1983) identifies as the prerequisite skills for success in the arts. He notes that visual memory, perception, and operations inherent in spatial cognition are interdependent features of a child's developing artistic skill. Milbrath cites this occurrence:

“researchers who emphasize production difficulties claim that young children are more competent than their drawing performance indicates. They interpret the classical errors in young children's drawings as inadequacies in planning and execution strategies rather than as indicators of conceptual immaturities or failures in perceptual analysis” (Milbrath, 1998, p. 29).

Milbrath (1998) also documented children's development of a visual memory as related to aesthetic development. The framework for this visual memory relates to children's ability to “encode” features of their environment. Milbrath defines “encoding” as the extent to which young children concentrate on particular aspects of their surroundings and take detailed records of how things appear.

The practice of encoding may seem irrelevant to a casual photographer who views photography merely as a simple click. However, though a desired scene may be captured in an instant, in order to produce a work of art, the photographer must intentionally consider how things appear. Thus, through photography, children learn how to deliberately increase their attentiveness to the aesthetic environment.

Developing a detailed memory requires premeditated efforts to explore the environment. Milbrath cites that young children encounter difficulties when attempting to systematically explore their immediate visual setting. Milbrath further explains that growth in looking strategies seem connected to more significant cognitive processes and changes.

Due to the cognitive influence on aesthetic development, Milbrath notes that children's artwork does not directly indicate their highest level of competence. In fact, "young children are a good deal more capable than their performance often indicates. Young children's object-centered drawings, therefore, may be less a function of their competence than strong cognitive preferences that influence their performance (Milbrath, 1998, p. 150).

No child is exempt from cognitive limitations; "even highly talented children lacked the cognitive maturity to utilize the transformation information potentially available from visual exploration" (Milbrath, 1998, p. 147). However, Milbrath discovered that talented children relied in part on figurative processes and, as a result, they were able to more effectively visually inspect the world.

Artistically talented children "see largely with their eyes rather than with their mind, they give a more developed sense of what can be represented graphically" (Milbrath, 1998, p. 253). The artistically talented children in Milbrath's study approach

their artwork with a fresh canvas both mentally and physically. On the contrary, children who see with their mind access previously developed beliefs about what an object should look like as opposed to what it truly does look like. Thus, they approach art making with a pre-anticipated mural, which is covered by layers of perceptual understandings.

When children's perceptual ability develops, it directly influences their artistic ability. Milbrath notes that around age seven, a child's perceptual ability to methodically examine and explore what they see significantly advances. Their drawing approach simultaneously transforms. The fact that these processes happen concurrently further supports Gardner's assertion that perception contributes a key element to a child's artistic development. In addition, Milbrath's conclusion highlights the value of a developing perceptual basis; children must increasingly grow in their ability to systematically analyze what they see.

Prior to analysis, children first perceive their environment. In his Picture Theory, Gibson (1971) explains that when children complete a drawing, they draw only what they know about an object. Thus, what the children are "seeing" relates directly to what they view as imperative to the object's identity. This object-centered approach to art does not capitalize on featuring the visible features of the artwork, which would constitute a view-specific approach.

The current research assessed children's aesthetic development, and artistic perceptions of subject. Analysis of photography tasks intended to (1) determine how individuals develop aesthetic understanding (2) identify the specific experiences that impact this process and (3) discern if the experiences can be linked to formal (school) contexts.

Envision a pair of spectators attending the unveiling of Michelangelo's David. One attendee for this grand event may melt with enthusiasm for the celebrated masterpiece and gaze at the sculpture for hours, while another may casually acknowledge the famous artwork with relative indifference. In such events, the personal value that various individuals hold for art will differ substantially among a crowd of gathered patrons. This range of emotional connection to and personal affinity for surrounding aesthetic features must correspond to elements of human development. From a human development perspective, an important and under-studied question is what accounts for these differences in maturity.

Use of Photography to Discern Aesthetic Development

Liben and Szechter (2002) offered one approach to answering the question of aesthetic development. They used photography-rating and photography-production tasks to study the impact of college photography curriculum on adults' responses to photographs. The most significant differences revealed in this study were linked to variations between the individual students. Liben and Szechter reflect, "Explaining how these individuals arrived at such dramatically different points by the time they reach a college-level photography appreciation course is a puzzle whose investigation fits squarely within the discipline of developmental psychology" (Liben & Szechter, 2002, p. 405). Thus, the impact of early training in the arts on adults' ensuing aesthetic understanding remains unknown. Will younger children show the effects of instruction?

Due to their adaptable nature, children may exhibit flexibility for new aesthetic development. Or, children might be relatively unreceptive because their cognitive-developmental level might make it difficult for them to appreciate the *form* (rather than the *content*) of art.

The following study draws from theories from psychologists, educators and artists to consider how children come to make sense of art. The results of this study will address questions regarding human development and the impact of specific experiences on children's appreciation for art.

In this study, students engaged in several different photography tasks through a structured classroom photography curriculum. Prior to the formal curriculum, children took a roll of "free exploration" photographs. Inviting the students to compose photographs with freedom allowed them to use creative energy without external influence. This free-exploration format was inspired by Milbrath's finding that "the less structured the context, the more children can rely on their own values and standards" (Milbrath, 1998, p.310).

The two versions of the photography curriculum -- photography appreciation and photography production -- both emphasized and nurtured the student's looking strategies. A looking strategy consists of the careful and astute attention to detail and position that requires time, understanding and a willingness to explore (Pratt, 1985). The lessons provided students with several opportunities to scan their environment with improved attentiveness.

Method

Participants

Participants in this study consisted of 38 first-grade students ranging in age from (6.25 to 7.5 years), 44 second-grade students (7.17 to 8.42), and 62 fifth-grade students (10.08 to 11.33). Students participated in the lessons and ratings as part of their art class activities. The criterion for inclusion in the analysis relied on classroom attendance; students who were not present at one or more photography ratings session were excluded from the data. The final sample included 143 students (70 females and 73 males). The students were tested in five different groups according to the conditions described below.

Materials

All five groups first heard an introduction to a 7-point photography rating procedure (see Appendices J and K), adapted from Liben and Szechter (2002). The scale asked children to rate how much they liked different photographs, ranging from 1 = you really don't like the photo to 7 = you really like the photo (details in Appendix).

After the rating system was described, students viewed nine photographs as examples of the types of photographs that they would see. They were instructed to practice having a quiet reaction to each photograph during the presentation so as not to influence their neighbor. Students then rated 25 photographs (Liben & Szechter, 2002), which included both famous and anonymous photographs. Slightly different response forms were given to fifth- and second-grade students (see Appendices J and K). Twice during the rating session, children were reminded: "Remember, you are rating each photograph according to how much you like it or don't like it," and, as needed:

“Remember, keep your ideas to yourself. Please make sure you react quietly to each photograph.”

Procedure

Three classes in each of three grades (first, second, and fifth) at Park Forest Elementary School participated in the study. Children rated 25 photographs during art class. Fifth-grade students wrote their explanations for their ratings of three photographs. First- and second-grade students explained the reasons for their rating selection individually to one of four interviewers during the week following the rating session.

Following the photography ratings, classes participated in one of three different art curricula. In fifth-grade, classes either learned photography appreciation, learned photographic production, or, followed the regular art curriculum. In second-grade, one class learned photography production, and the other three classes (all of which were combined first- and second-grade) followed the regular art curriculum. After the month-long curriculum, children in each class again rated the 25 photographs and explained their ratings of three of the photographs. The focus on this study is on changes in the explanations in relation to the three types of curricula.

One week prior to the first official photography appreciation or photography production class, students participated in a “free exploration” phase. Students in all fifth-grade classes and in the second-grade Photography Production class received a disposable camera with the following instructions: *“Today, you are getting your own camera. This camera is your new buddy, please be careful that you don’t lose it. Please take pictures of whatever you want! Make sure to take all the pictures on the roll!”* Students expressed a great deal of enthusiasm for completing the free-exploration task.

The photographs students took during the free exploration task were developed and used for classroom activities during the various photography lessons.

Every fifth-grade student in the photography curriculum classes completed a categorizing task for their first roll of free-exploration film. Children separated their photographs into four categories: (1) A beautiful photograph (2) An important photograph (3) A photograph that shows something about who you are and (4) A photograph that shows excitement. Students matted each selected photograph and used these frames for different activities throughout the lessons. Table 1 and 2 summarize the activities used in the study.

Table 1: Fifth-grade Procedure

	December	January-February	March
Fifth-grade Photography Appreciation	Rate 25 selected photos; responses recorded on rating sheet. (see Appendix J)	Complete First Free-Exploration Roll of Film (Part 1 of 2) Receive photo appreciation instruction during regular art period. (see Appendices A, B, C).	Complete Second Free-Exploration Roll of Film (Part 2 of 2) Rate 25 selected photos; responses recorded on rating sheet. (see Appendix J)
Fifth-grade Photography Production	Rate 25 selected photos; responses recorded on rating sheet. (see Appendix J)	Complete First Free-Exploration Roll of Film (Part 1 of 2) Receive photo production instruction during regular art period. (see Appendices D, E, F).	Complete Second Free-Exploration Roll of Film (Part 2 of 2) Rate 25 selected photos; responses recorded on rating sheet. (see Appendix J)
Fifth-grade Control	Rate 25 selected photos; responses recorded on rating sheet. (see Appendix J)	Complete First Free-Exploration Roll of Film (Part 1 of 2) Receive regular art curriculum instruction during regular art period.	Complete Second Free-Exploration Roll of Film (Part 2 of 2) Rate 25 selected photos; responses recorded on rating sheet. (see Appendix J)

Table 2: First Grade and Second-grade Procedure

	December	January - February	March
Second-grade Photography Production	Rate 25 selected photos; responses recorded on rating sheet. (see Appendix J) Provide reasons for ratings of three selected photographs during an interview session	Complete First Free-Exploration Roll of Film (Part 1 of 2) Receive photo production instruction during regular art period. (see Appendices G, H, I).	Complete Second Free-Exploration Roll of Film (Part 2 of 2) Rate 25 selected photos; responses recorded on rating sheet. (see Appendix J)
First and Second- grade Control	Rate 25 selected photos; responses recorded on rating sheet. (see Appendix J) Provide reasons for ratings of three selected photographs during an interview session	Complete First Free-Exploration Roll of Film (Part 1 of 2) Receive regular art curriculum instruction during regular art period.	Complete Second Free-Exploration Roll of Film (Part 2 of 2) Rate 25 selected photos; responses recorded on rating sheet. (see Appendix J)

Both fifth- and second-grade Photography Production students completed interactive photography demonstrations on-line. Children could manually use a virtual camera to take pictures of a scene Kodak offered online (www.kodak.com). The Kodak website provided instant feedback for the students on the following basic, yet important topics: (1) using a plain background (2) moving the subject in from the middle (3) locking the focus (4) knowing your flash's range (5) watching the lighting and (6) troubleshooting your pictures. Students expressed excitement for this activity, largely because of the allure from having instant feedback. Children read through the mini-tutorials online, which provided them with knowledge of how to artistically plan out their photographs and how to appropriately carry out the task.

During the lesson, the students applied their knowledge of Kodak guidelines to analyze the compositions of several different photographs. Children learned to decipher the features of photographic design that determine the outcome of the artwork. These

skills provided students with the opportunity to exhibit a higher level of competence than their performance on previous tasks may have exhibited.

To reinforce the process of skill development, students analyzed their own photographs according to the Kodak guidelines. As they had now become familiar with the Kodak website, fifth-grade students individually read through more involved tutorials and analyzed their photographs according to the suggestions. Using the four previously selected free-exploration photographs (beautiful, important, exciting, self-capturing), students recorded the strengths and weakness of their composition on the matted photograph. Second-grade students completed a similar activity in a group discussion and sharing format, using their previously selected favorite and least favorite photographs.

The fifth-grade photography appreciation class learned “how to imaginatively put [photographs] back into their original contexts, to see what the photographer has done to make a picture, to study what was included, and how, and to imagine what was excluded and why” (Barrett, 1990, p. 78). Fifth-grade students selected a photograph from their roll to post anywhere on a blank paper. They were instructed to place the photograph back in either (a) its original context or (b) an imaginative context. Children then extended the borders, adding on to the original photograph.

For a detailed account of the fifth-grade Photography Appreciation curriculum, please see Appendices A, B, C. For a detailed account of the fifth-grade Photography Production curriculum, please see Appendices D, E, F. For a detailed account of the second-grade Photography Production curriculum, please see Appendices G, H, I.

After students participated in one of the curricula for one month, each fifth-grade class again received a free exploration disposable camera. This time, the instructions

took on a new form, specific to the curriculum the class had studied (see Appendices C and F). Students in Photography Appreciation and Photography Production classes were directed to use their new understandings and skill with photography when completing this roll of film. Students in the control group received the same instructions as they had already received during their initial free exploration task, which did not provide any direction or specific tasks. After completing the last roll of free exploration film, every class again completed the photography ratings procedure as described above.

Results and Discussion

This study documents children's artistic preferences through their narrated responses and explanations to three photographs at two different times: first, prior to any photography instruction, and the second after the photography curriculum had been completed. Numerical data from ratings will be incorporated into a paper that includes data from adults collected earlier (Liben & Szechter, 2002). The results and discussion section is organized into two parts. First, portions of the Photography Appreciation classroom experiences are described and analyzed. Next, a sample of students' explanations for their response to three photographs at time one and time two is described and analyzed.

Classroom Narratives from the Fifth-grade Photography Appreciation Class

During the first photography appreciation lesson (see Appendix A), fifth-grade students responded to Janson and Cauman's quote: "Photographs reinterpret the world around us, literally making us see it in new terms" (1971, p.697). Children were randomly placed in conversation groups, and asked to discuss why they agreed or disagreed with the statement. One student originally disagreed, stating that "you actually have to paint something [to reinterpret] the world. You don't want to just click a picture." After discussing their perspective with a classmate who strongly agreed with the quote, this student changed his mind and agreed with the message of Janson and Cauman's quote. For example, one of his group members provided evidence for her opposing position: "I was on vacation in Puerto Rico at Christmas, and on the last day, I was looking at the ocean, and my mom took a picture of me on the beach. I saw it two

weeks later, and I didn't remember the beach looking so pretty when I was there as it looked in the photograph." (It looked prettier in the photograph; thus, it reinterpreted the world that she had remembered).

While responding to the quote, students also focused on the way that photographs draw attention to a moment that may otherwise pass unnoticed: "You don't usually look just at a flower by itself – but with a picture of just a flower, it makes you think about it more." Through this activity, students became more aware of the implications that photography has on life. As this student discovered, using photography as an artistic medium causes viewers to focus on typically unnoticed features of the world.

This commentary connects with the ideas expressed by a viewer in Housen's second, constructive stage. Here, the viewer realizes that they must move "from an approach of looking once and imagining to an approach of looking many times, looking more carefully, and puzzling" (Housen, 1983, p. 13). The student realized that rather than just processing simple observations about the content, an artwork "makes you think about it more."

One student considered how photographs can reinterpret events: "they are used as many different resources and [the same photo] can be used for the same topic, but people can use different words and opinions for the same picture." This student addressed a significant truth that speaks to the heart of Housen's fourth, interpretive stage. Here, viewers expect that "each new encounter with a work of art presents a chance for new comparisons, insights, and experiences. Knowing that the work of art's identity and value are subject to re-interpretation, these viewers see their own processes subject to change" (Housen, 2001, p. 9). This student recognized that photographs do reinterpret

events because each photograph invites an unlimited number of individual responses. As the viewer developed new insights, the viewer reinterprets the photograph's message.

Another student considered the way that a viewer's interpretation of a single photograph changes through time. She reflected: "each time you look at [a photograph], it changes. The more times you look at it, the more you start to realize about it." This student similarly addressed a fundamental aspect of the interpretive stage. She became aware that through revisiting the same photograph, she was revisiting her interpretation and inviting a change. She also acknowledged that through looking longer at a photograph, new realizations develop.

The fifth-grade Photography Appreciation students critiqued two photographs at a time. While comparing the two photographs, students were also asked to consider the potential intentions the artist may have had when planning the picture. The students' commentaries guided the discussion. I provided the following questions as kindling for the conversation. (1) What do you think that the photographer was thinking when he/she made this art? (2) What message does he or she want to send through his photograph? (3) Where do you think that this photograph was taken? (4) What are the noises, smells, and textures that you think you would find if you were in this photograph? (5) How do you think that the photographer captured these sensations well in his artwork? (6) What do you think that the scenery is like around the subject of the photograph? (7) How does this photograph make you feel? (8) What do you like or not like about this photograph? Students participated enthusiastically in the discussion. Their commentaries grew richer through time as they began to form connections, and, notice vast differences among the photographs. Through providing open-ended responses, students considered several

features of each photograph. The composition took on new importance; students pondered how the composition affected the final work.

While reflecting on a photograph of children in a window, one student said “I like it because of the children; they have life. But the children look pushed together.” A classmate added, “Yeah, they are all together, but I like the composition.” A neighbor commented, “It looks like the people in the window have no expression.” A final remark summarized: “it’s mysterious, what is happening to the people?” Students noted that the composition influenced the final message of the work.

During these discussions, it became apparent that children are highly capable, indeed enthusiastic to communicate their appreciation for various aesthetic elements. However, there was a divergence between their ability to create artwork and their ability to appreciate aesthetic elements. Milbrath explains that a child will appreciate an aesthetic feature earlier than he or she will be able to reconstruct that element. According to Milbrath’s insight, students should exhibit more competence when expressing appreciation for art as compared to the level of skill they invest when completing the photography creation tasks.

Children’s levels of appreciation for art and their ability to produce art develop at different paces. Likewise, students gradually discern how the different elements of photography interact to create a final work of art. In the discussion formats, children considered the interaction between the image selected and the technique used to capture this image. Chapman shares that “In order to appreciate photography...as [an] art form, children have to consider relationships among the illusions created in [this] media, the techniques by which the illusions are created, and the way in which human experience is characterized.” (Chapman, 1990, p. 279)

Essentially, photography, as an art form, requires several different levels of understanding. The artist must attend to mechanical techniques while also foreseeing how their camera's position will capture the "human experience." This delicate interaction between subject and technique connects to children's developing understanding of perception. As students learn to evaluate what they perceive not only as a function of subject, but also as an interaction between subject and technique, they can assess their surroundings with deeper understanding. Thus, forums such as this one, involving a carefully sequenced curriculum, invite students to consider the results of their artistic actions.

Students' Explanations of Rating Responses

The students' explanations of their ratings provide more explicit links to the various stages of aesthetic development. From looking through the patterns apparent in the following samplings of responses, it appears that the fifth-grade appreciation and fifth-grade control group have comparable responses. The quality of their explanations did not appear to change. However, the quality of the explanations offered by the fifth- and second-grade Photography Production students did appear to change.

In the responses there is evidence of initial progression through the proposed aesthetic development stages. However, students consistently retained similar thought patterns from time one to time two. The same personal connections to the subject, or, relative dislike for the object were often included. In the photography production classes, the biggest difference in a typical time two response was the addition of new technical awareness. Tables 3 - 7 provide excerpts from each class, and the qualitative differences between time one and time two are discussed below.

Table 3: Fifth-grade Photography Production Class: Student Explanations

Man with Kitten	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<p><i>Rating: 3</i> It isn't very interesting. I do like the cats though, but the dust/fog cloud-whatever it is, it makes the scene less interesting. I probably would've given it a higher rating if it was in color. Then it would be more interesting.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 5</i> There is no distracting background. Sure, there's a puff of smoke, but that makes distracting things disappear. I also like the cute kittens. I also like how the man is looking at the kitten crawling in his arms.</p>
<p><i>Rating: 6</i> The man in the picture looks like his kitten is one of the only good things in his life. I really like his expression and the cat's expression. I also like the mist in the background. The cat is adorable!!!!!!</p>	<p><i>Rating: 5</i> I think the light and focus were really good. I also like the way the man is off center, and the mist goes right up behind him. Plus, the kitten is so cute!</p>
<p><i>Rating: 4</i> I like the background of this picture and also the man who is carrying the cute little kitten and the steam sets a good picture also.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 6</i> I like the fact that it has like 2 backgrounds that aren't distracting. Another thing is I like how the subject uses the rule of thirds. I also like that the subject is not looking at you, I think that would make the picture too direct.</p>
Diving Feet	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<p><i>Rating: 2</i> It's just a big foot. It looks weird and the only reason I didn't give it a 1 is because I don't hate it. I can't even tell what the big picture is. He might be jumping off something into the water but he could also be doing a lot of other things! I'm not even sure if it's a he or she.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 1</i> Pictures of wet feet don't exactly look good. The person really has two feet in the picture, but it looks like they have one foot with 2 heels and 7 toes. But, I sort of like how the camera focuses on the foot.</p>
<p><i>Rating: 3</i> I do not look at feet. I like how you can see the water in the air. I like how the background is faded.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 5</i> I saw the water going everywhere and I thought that was very cool how they got that shot. It was kind of cool how they got him coming off the platform. Plus the person has scaled it looks like and I liked how the background is.</p>
<p><i>Rating: 1</i> It was kind of gross seeing a closeup on feet. And it looked weird with feet right in the middle. BAM! Feet. That's what I thought when I saw this picture.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 1</i> I think wet feet are nasty it I was a real judge in a photography contest he or she would definitely lose. I do like how it is centered but I still think its weird. Also I like it because its like the feet are in slow motion!</p>

Table 3: Fifth-grade Photography Production Class: Student Explanations (continued)

Close up of Dog's Face	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<p><i>Rating: 7</i> I LOVE PUPPIES! They are so cute. Also I think it is funny because it's just a really big nose in the picture. I'd give this a 20 but the sheet doesn't go that high.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 7</i> I think it's a cool picture because it is from a "dogs eye view" and it makes the people looking at the picture feel small like the dog. I think it would be a better picture if you could see the dogs eyes and the rest of his head. I also like this photo because the dog is cute and it looks like he is smiling!</p>
<p><i>Rating: 6</i> The dog in the picture is soooooooooooooo cute and you don't usually see pictures like this.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 7</i> I liked how they zoom in. Another reason is I like how they got level with the subject. I like the background plain.</p>
<p><i>Rating: 7</i> I (heart) dogs! This dog has character and this is a funny picture. The dog reminds me of my dog, whose name is fritz and has a giant nose just like this dog.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 7</i> I (heart) dogs and this picture really captures the spirit of a dog. The lighting makes his nose look extra big and his goofy grin makes you want to laugh. A truly adorable picture.</p>

Students in the fifth-grade Photography Production class demonstrated more advanced responses with respect to stages described by Housen and Parsons. This development was most directly linked to their ability to identify the reason that certain parts of the photograph turned out a certain way.

For example, when first responding to the man with kitten photograph, one student explained that she liked "the man who is carrying the cute little kitten." Here, she focused on the artwork's appeal, characteristic of a viewer in Parson's stage one, favoritism. During time two, the same student explained "I also like that the subject is not looking at you, I think that would make the picture too direct." The student considered an aspect of the technical production just as a viewer in Parson's stage four focuses on style and form. This student was aware of the connection between the subject and the formal arrangement.

Another student originally stated that the man and kitten photograph "isn't very interesting. I do like the cats though, but the dust/fog cloud-whatever it is, it makes the scene less interesting." Here, the child has decided that he does not like the photograph

because it “isn’t very interesting.” The student is concerned with the artwork’s appeal, which is again a priority for viewers in Parson’s stage one.

During time two, this student began to consider the implications of the “less interesting” parts of the photograph. He commented: “there’s a puff of smoke, but that makes distracting things disappear.” The same part of the photograph that originally bothered the student is now viewed with purpose. The student suggests that this part of the photograph was included for a reason. Similar to his classmate’s progression, this student’s commentaries advanced from a stage one to a stage four understanding.

Students’ new understanding of technical aspects of photography also influenced the quality of their responses to a photograph that they initially liked very much. One student responded during time one, “I (heart) dogs! This dog has character and this is a funny picture. The dog reminds me of my dog, whose name is fritz and has a giant nose just like this dog.” Similar to a viewer in Housen’s stage one, this child considers the personal connections she has with the photograph, rather than an emphasis on the artwork itself.

Her time two response demonstrates progression toward Housen’s stage three, similar to Parson’s stage four. In this constructive stage, a viewer considers the formal elements of the artwork. For example, this student stated, “this picture really captures the spirit of a dog. The lighting makes his nose look extra big and his goofy grin makes you want to laugh. A truly adorable picture.” The child discusses what the photographer had to do in order to produce the artwork. The student directly attributes expression to technique; she compares the way that the photograph “captures the spirit of a dog” to the way that the photographer used lighting.

In general, students did not like the diving feet photograph. Although there was a noticeable qualitative change from time one to time two, the students still commented on their distaste for feet. For example, one student in time one stated, “It’s just a big foot. It looks weird and the only reason I didn’t give it a 1 is because I don’t hate it.” Her commentary became a time two response of “Pictures of wet feet don’t exactly look good. The person really has two feet in the picture, but it looks like they have one foot with 2 heels and 7 toes.” Through analyzing what is actually seen, the student deciphered that “it looks weird” because the extra toes and heel from foot two that are in view. Thus, the student employed more astute looking strategies in time two, and moved from her fixation on the object centered ideas (i.e. the foot has seven toes, therefore it is weird) to an understanding of “how the camera focuses on the foot.”

Table 4: Second-grade Photography Production Class: Student Explanations

Man with Kitten	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<p><i>Rating: 3</i> Because I thought it was on fire and I don’t like people being on fire and picking out animals who might be injured. I don’t like it when it looks like a poor town. Like a poor town where people can get something to eat. I don’t think that’s very good.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 4</i> Well I didn’t like it because it was kind of dark, and the smoke, it covered the building that you wanted to see and the rest of the street.</p>
<p><i>Rating: 7</i> It’s the kitty – I like cats, since I like cats, I like the picture. It’s only about the cat. I have one, a tiger cat. This one looks just like it. Stripes from its head to its back.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 7</i> Well, I have a cat and the cat in the picture looks exactly like that. And the subject is off center, it’s off to the side and it looks like he took the cat out of the fire.</p>
<p><i>Rating: 5</i> Because it has a little kitten, a sorta happy and sad picture. Because he saved a kitten from a fire. That was the only reason why.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 5</i> Because these there was a kitten and it seems like he saved the kitten from the fire. Maybe add a little color and some other people.</p>

Table 4: Second-grade Photography Production Class: Student Explanations (continued)

Diving Feet	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<p><i>Rating: 7</i> Well, it' kinda hard to explain, but I really liked it because I thought it was someone diving off a diving board. I thought it was like a lady, so I really liked it.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 4</i> I wanted to see the whole picture of the body, but I liked it because it was focused on the feet.</p>
<p><i>Rating: 4</i> It looks like there's a person in a swimming contest. It could be that the person is going for a swim – water splashing.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 5</i> I like it because it really shows you what the person is doing. The main part is in focus; the back of the picture is kind of fuzzy. Also, the lighting is very good.</p>
<p><i>Rating: 1</i> It doesn't look exciting. I'd rather see like animals. It's just feet!</p>	<p><i>Rating: 4</i> Don't really like it, because, well, it is good aiming, the person took the picture good. But I don't care for just feet and legs. It has nice color in it. You can't really see the background, which is good, but it would be nice if there were cameras that could take pictures of both things; the background and whatever you're taking a picture of.</p>
Close up of Dog's Face	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<p><i>Rating: 7</i> Cause I really, really like doggies!</p>	<p><i>Rating: 6</i> Because I think the dog is really cute, but I can't really see the ears. And it looks like a bad picture because it's a dog with no eyes in it.</p>
<p><i>Rating: 1</i> What I mean about liking animals is, like fish, amphibians, reptiles, not dogs.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 3</i> Well, one thing is that I kind of like dogs. You can see the dog, but I don't think they used the flash good. I can't see the face, but part is not visible. So it sort of looks like a house, sitting on top of a dog's body. It's not really exciting.</p>
<p><i>Rating: 7</i> Well it looks like there's a dog – can't see eyes because of black background. Some spots on it. Since I really like dogs, I like it.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 7</i> I really like it because I like dogs. The main part is in focus. It's really dark where you don't need to see stuff. I can't think of anything else.</p>

Children in the second-grade Photography Production class likewise demonstrated an increasing quality in their types of responses. Just as the fifth-grade students used their new technical understandings to support their reasoning, so too, the second-grade students focused on each photograph's technical merit.

For example, when first responding to the man with kitten photograph, one student observed, "It's the kitty – I like cats, since I like cats, I like the picture. It's only

about the cat. I have one, a tiger cat. This one looks just like it. Stripes from its head to its back.” Here, she developed a personal connection to the artwork. Her statement lines up identically with Housen’s stage one where the viewer primarily forms an opinion about the artwork based on its connection to his or her personal experiences. This commentary is also characteristic of a viewer in Parson’s stage one, favoritism. The child plainly states “I like cats, since I like cats, I like the picture.” A Parson’s stage one understanding does not become any clearer than this. The child likes what is shown in the photograph and thus, she likes the photograph.

During time two, the same student explained “Well, I have a cat and the cat in the picture looks exactly like that. And the subject is off center, it’s off to the side and it looks like he took the cat out of the fire.” The student briefly considered an aspect of the technical production just as a viewer in Parson’s stage four focuses on style and form. However, the student was more aware of the connection between the subject and her everyday life, which identifies that part of her response remains in Parson’s stage one.

Another student stated during time one that she disliked the man and kitten photograph “Because I thought it was on fire and I don’t like people being on fire and picking out animals who might be injured. I don’t like it when it looks like a poor town. Like a poor town where people can get something to eat. I don’t think that’s very good.” Here, the child provides a narrative to accompany the photograph. Through story telling, the student determines their feelings about the photograph. Housen’s identifies this process in stage one; the viewer focuses on the personal ideas they are reminded of by the artwork.

During time two, this student began to consider the implications of the technical aspect of the photograph. No longer concerned with the story behind the photograph, she

states, “Well I didn’t like it because it was kind of dark, and the smoke, it covered the building that you wanted to see and the rest of the street.” The quality of this student’s commentaries advanced from Housen’s stage one, focused on narratives, to stage three, emphasizing the artwork’s composition and formal qualities.

Students also shared narratives for the diving feet photograph. Through using the narratives to explain their ideas, the second-grade students were less hesitant than the fifth-grade students to like the diving feet photograph. For example, one student in time one stated, “It looks like there’s a person in a swimming contest. It could be that the person is going for a swim – water splashing.” The narrative features of his commentary are comparable to those shared about the man with kitten photograph.

His response changed from a narrative to a focus on technical features during time two: “I like it because it really shows you what the person is doing. The main part is in focus; the back of the picture is kind of fuzzy. Also, the lighting is very good.” Throughout his response, the student methodically dissected the various technical components that contributed to the artwork’s overall effect.

The second-graders’ new technical understandings also influenced the quality of their responses to the dog photograph. Children generally liked this photograph very much; as one student exclaims, she gave it a rating of seven “Cause I really, really like doggies!” Similar to a viewer in Parson’s stage one, this child values that the photograph shows something that she “really, really” likes.

Her time two response demonstrates progression toward Parson’s stage two, with an emphasis on realism. This student reflected on her rating, stating: “I think the dog is really cute, but I can’t really see the ears. And it looks like a bad picture because it’s a dog with no eyes in it.” Her response indicates the essence of stage two, “form is

understood at stage two primarily as a function of the subject...we appreciate form insofar as it contributes to realistic representation” (Parsons, 1987, p.88). The child discusses how the form influenced the depiction of the dog. Since the ears and eyes are not visible, the photograph loses its quality.

Table 5: Fifth-grade Photography Appreciation Class: Student Explanations:

Man with Kitten	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<p><i>Rating: 4</i> It's hard to see what it is and it just looks too dramatic. It has a man than clouds. It doesn't look natural. And you can't tell he's holding a cat. And I'm not really crazy about photographs of people.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 4</i> It shows mystery, excitement and companionship. But it's kind of blankish. It also looks like something some one would draw, not take a photo of.</p>
<p><i>Rating: 1</i> I thought this photograph looked really sad. I don't really like sad photos. It looks like the man has saved a cat from smoke. The environment looks very sad to live in! It this photo was in color, I might rate it different because I might be able to actually tell what is going on!</p>	<p><i>Rating: 2</i> I don't like this picture much because it seems sad. It looks like something sad happened. I think this because of all the smokey-looking stuff behind the man. Even though it looks like the man saved the kitten he still looks sad. It looks like a sad place to be in, the buildings look matted and old, the alley looks wet and the smoke looks overwhelming!</p>
<p><i>Rating: 1</i> It isn't a very happy photo and the mist in the background makes the picture look scary. The buildings look sinister and dark and the guy in the picture looks like he is stealing the cat which makes him very very very evil. (it looks like he doesn't have eyes).</p>	<p><i>Rating: 1</i> I think this photo is scary. Because it is dark. Also it looks like he doesn't have any eyes. The mist in the background is scary. And it looks like he is stealing the cat (or he could hurt the cat).</p>
Diving Feet	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<p><i>Rating: 1</i> I definitely didn't like this!! Especially because the feet are really gross. Even though I'm on the swim team and I look like that and I see other people doing it, it still is gross! Plus I don't see people doing it up that close and whenever I see it up so close it is just not cool. Feet to me are so gross and it is absolutely so so so so gross to see them that close up.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 1</i> Feet terrify me! Except for my own of course! I just don't like that vein but I do see it all of the time because I'm on the swim team!!</p>
<p><i>Rating: 3</i> I did not like the picture because I did not like feet. I do like it because it has something to do with swimming and there are a lot of colors.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 1</i> I hated this picture. I didn't like this because the picture is of feet and I don't like feet. One thing I did like about this picture was the person was swimming.</p>

Table 5: Fifth-grade Photography Appreciation Class: Student Explanations (continued)

<i>Rating: 1</i> I don't want to see a picture with feet in it. Also his feet look like a frogs (webbed feet). His toes are gray. I would of like it if showed the whole guy instead of just his feet.	<i>Rating: 1</i> I don't really like swimming that much and it doesn't capture the whole picture. I would have liked it better if it had a background and some more details in it. Also I rather have been look at the whole body instead of just the feet because the feet look deformed and it would be better with more details.
Close up of Dog's Face	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<i>Rating: 5</i> The doge is cute. You can only see the nose. I think the dog is curious about the camera.	<i>Rating: 3</i> You can't see the rest of the dog's face and I don't like that very much. I gave it a 4 first. You don't usually focus on just the nose and I kind of like it for that but I still don't really like it.
<i>Rating: 6</i> It is sort of cute. I like dogs and the close up picture is very creative and sort of original. It's cool the way you can't see its eyes and its teeth are sort of cool, like I said before it's original and that's a good thing. If you look at it for a while it looks like a train going through the tunnel, with snow on top.	<i>Rating: 4</i> I think this picture is kind of cute. But if it is your first time looking at the picture you might not know what it is. Or think it is something else. It might take a while to realize it is a dog. I would like it better if it was a whole picture.
<i>Rating: 3</i> I can't really see what it is. I think it was too close up. It was also in black and white. I liked it because it is a dog and it is kind of a funny photograph. You can also see the dog's teeth, which I think is cool.	<i>Rating: 5</i> It is a dog. I really like dogs. I don't like it because you can't see a lot of it. I think the person took the picture too close up. I think its cool that it looks like the dog is smiling. I also like the dog's face and how it is black and white

Students in the fifth-grade Photography Appreciation class did not demonstrate as much of a qualitative change as those identified in responses by Photography Production students. Their responses do reveal a pattern of increased appreciation for various photographs.

For example, when first responding to the man with kitten photograph, one student observed, "It's hard to see what it is and it just looks too dramatic. It has a man than clouds. It doesn't look natural. And you can't tell he's holding a cat." Here, she focuses on if the photograph "looks natural." Viewers in Housen's stage two, are concerned with logical representations; "if the work does not look the way it is 'supposed

to'...than the viewers judge the work 'weird,' lacking and of no value" (Housen, 1983, p.8).

During time two, the same student explained "It shows mystery, excitement and companionship. But it's kind of blankish. It also looks like something some one would draw, not take a photo of." The student briefly considers the photograph from a Housen's stage four perspective. She begins to note the emotional appeals that the photograph makes; communicating that the photography "shows mystery, excitement and companionship."

Two other students remained fairly consistent in their response to the man with kitten photograph. One student stated during time one that she "thought this photograph looked really sad." In time two, the same student again structured her response around not liking the photograph "because it seemed sad. Her classmate found the photograph scary during time one and again, in time two reflected primarily on how the photograph was dark and scary.

As compared to the progress that second and fifth-grade Photography Production students made, the fifth-grade photography appreciation students demonstrated less development in their responses. When there were changes, they were clearly attributed to appreciative elements of the work.

For example, when responding to the dog photograph, one student noted during time one, "You can only see the nose." By time two, the same student began to consider the implications of this feature: "You don't usually focus on just the nose and I kind of like it for that but I still don't really like it." The student developed a willingness to look beyond a casual observation and to consider the unique contribution that the photographer made in producing the artwork.

Another fifth-grade student responded to the dog photograph during time one by noting: “I can’t really see what it is. I think it was too close up. It was also in black and white.” During time two, the student identified again that “the person took the picture too close up [and] I also like the dog’s face and how it is black and white.” The student provides similar comments to support his ideas before and after the lessons.

Although fifth-grade Photography Appreciation students’ responses changed to both the man with kitten picture and the dog picture, for the fifth-grade students the diving feet picture did not elicit the same level of qualitative changes. In both time one and time two, they were focused on whether they liked feet or not.

For example, one student states in time one: “I did not like the picture because I did not like feet. I do like it because it has something to do with swimming and there are a lot of colors.” This response demonstrates a Parson’s stage one understanding; since the viewer does not like the subject, the viewer does not like the photograph.

His time two response demonstrates that he was impervious to change: “I hated this picture. I didn’t like this because the picture is of feet and I don’t like feet. One thing I did like about this picture was the person was swimming.” Whereas a second-grade Photography Production student who started at this level in time one progressed to Parson’s stage four in time two, the fifth-grade Photography Appreciation student did not.

Table 6: Fifth-grade Control Class: Student Explanations

Man with Kitten	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<p><i>Rating: 6</i> I gave this rating because I didn’t like the smoke but the photo look good and sad. Also the guy looked happy to have the cat.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 1</i> Though the man looks happy it looks like he just his cat from a fire. It looks sad. And I normally like landscape and nature and more happy pics.</p>
<p><i>Rating: 7</i> I love cats and it reminded me of my cat when I first got her and because that guy saved that cat from a fire. It looks like he really likes the cat too.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 7</i> That guy saved that cat and it was just so nice of that person. It looks like he really likes that cat too.</p>

Table 6: Fifth-grade Control Class: Student Explanations (continued)

<p><i>Rating: 4</i> It was ok because the man in the picture looks evil. That's the downside. The upside is that I think he rescued the cat from all the smoke in the background. There also is a lot of pollution in the picture which is not good. Maybe the man started it. That's why I gave it in the middle because he could've created the smoke or he could have saved the cat from dying. So since I didn't know that much and it doesn't have any beauty but it could be a nice thing that he did.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 4</i> It kind of looks weird. I mean there's a guy who looks sort of odd, holding a cat with smoke in the background. At the bottom it looks like a big building at night.</p>
Diving Feet	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<p><i>Rating: 6</i> It really doesn't look like anything except for a person diving. But I love to swim. I am really good at it. I can do a front flip off it.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 6</i> I think that the girl likes to go swimming. I like to go swimming too. Maybe if I could see more of the person maybe I could rate it a 7</p>
<p><i>Rating: 1</i> It's a close up of a foot! It doesn't make much sense! I know it's jumping off a diving board, but still!</p>	<p><i>Rating: 1</i> It's only a foot. Does a foot have much importance? No! If it weren't a foot, I would of rated it higher. Like if they put the person diving. That would have been better than a foot.</p>
<p><i>Rating: 5</i> It was a nice photograph! It was definitely not the best but it's so cool see that particular pose in one spot! It could have been better if it was closer up. I like how you can see the water in midair, it makes it so much more interesting. I can see a hair on the leg, too so I think it is a great close up but not the best picture.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 6</i> I think it captured the moment well. The water in mid-air looks kind of cool and when you look at the photo you feel like you're there- where that person is swimming. It kind of looks like the person is a good swimmer.</p>
Close up of Dog's Face	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<p><i>Rating: 5</i> I did like it a lot! If you're wondering why I didn't give it a 6 or a 7 its because its pretty hard to determine things about the picture. I wonder if the dog is mad or happy? This photograph makes me have mixed feeling. If you look at it one way, the dog is happy and licking you. It can also be a mad dog attacking.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 6</i> It's a very cute photo. I like how the top of the face blends in with the background, but you can still tell it's a dog. I also like it because it looks professional. It looks like the dogs about to lick the camera and that's cute.</p>
<p><i>Rating: 2</i> I couldn't make out what it is so I gave it a low rating because I had no idea what it was. It's kinda hard to see in black and white. The mouth is a little messed up. I have no clue how they can get that snap shot.</p>	<p><i>Rating: 6</i> The dog kinda blends into the darkness. Also he has, or what looks like, two sets of upper teeth. Plus you can't see his eyes. But somehow I just think it's a cool picture! Woah! If you look at it upside down, the head looks like a gorilla head with closed eyes and a white beard. Cool! Who ever said it was a dog?</p>
<p><i>Rating: 7</i> I love dogs they are so cute and the way his nose is sticking out it is so cute. I really really like</p>	<p><i>Rating: 6</i> I really like dogs and his nose is so so cute in this picture. And the dot on top of his nose is so cute</p>

dogs especially puppies. Also the puppy has this little dot on his nose and it makes the puppy look cuter than any other puppy. So I gave this photograph a really high rating because I do really like puppies and dogs so this photograph deserves a really high rating!	and it's a puppy. One thing I don't like about it thought is they chose for the background to be the same color as the puppy's ears.
--	--

Table 7: First and Second-grade Control Class: Student Explanations

Man with Kitten	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<i>Rating: 7</i> Because it's a cat, and I like animals. Because you can see the buildings over here. And I like the white part around it [the man]. And I like the boy holding the cat. I like this [points to the road] because it looks like there's puddles there. The cat's sorta hugging the man. Because you can see the windows and doors.	<i>Rating: 7</i> Because I really like animals and I like the background because there is a house in it, with the brick; I like brick houses.
<i>Rating: 2</i> I thought that I would like it better if it had color. The reason I didn't totally not like it [pointing to face #1] is because of the lamb.	<i>Rating: 5</i> Well I liked the lamb and the buildings in the background kind of remind me of NYC, and that's where I've been.
<i>Rating: 7</i> I liked it because he's saving the cat. Because he's saving the cat and it's nice of him to do it.	<i>Rating: 7</i> I like it because the guy is saving the cat. That's the only reason.
Diving Feet	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<i>Rating: 1</i> It's somebody's foot. You really don't want to look at it.	<i>Rating: 1</i> It's like not a photo I want to look at; I don't like looking at other people's feet.
<i>Rating: 7</i> Cause it was funny. It's like itching or feeling with his feet.	<i>Rating: 7</i> It's funny, because he's like scratching with his toe.
<i>Rating: 5</i> I like it because the feet are funny. I don't like that it just shows the foot – why doesn't it show more of the body? Why not all the body and more decoration? Need more of the body and diving board.	<i>Rating: 4</i> All it shows is his feet. It's not a lot of detail but it has color; the feet are on the side. It's like it's floating in the air.

Table 7: First and Second-grade Control Class: Student Explanations (continued)

Close up of Dog's Face	
Student response, Time 1	Same Student response, Time 2
<i>Rating: 7</i> Because I really like dogs, and it looks really cute and stuff.	<i>Rating: 7</i> Because I really like dogs and that is my favorite animal. I like every animal and this I my most favorite. It looks really cute because it has black and white on it
<i>Rating: 6</i> I like it very well because it's a dog and it's cute. But, I didn't put a 7 because his teeth are white and ugly. I put a 6 because I want a dog.	<i>Rating: 5</i> It's because it's black and white and his teeth are all black. Why don't they show his teeth like dog's teeth usually are? It's ears are black and it's all black; so it looks like he's disappearing into the black.
<i>Rating: 7</i> Cause the doggie looks cute...its nose is big.	<i>Rating: 7</i> I just like the dog; his nose is close up to the camera and he's a hound dog. And I like hound dogs. That's it.

Students in the first-, second- and fifth-grade control group, learning the regular art curriculum, did not demonstrate as much of a qualitative change as those exhibited in responses by Photography Production students. The control group responses were consistent from time one to time two. In addition the responses offered by the fifth-grade control group students were similar in quality to those offered by the first- and second-grade control group students.

For example, when first responding to the man with kitten photograph, one fifth-grade student observed, "I love cats and it reminded me of my cat when I first got her and because that guy saved that cat from a fire. It looks like he really likes the cat too." During time two, the same student explained "That guy saved that cat and it was just so nice of that person. It looks like he really likes that cat too." The student was aware of the connection between the subject and her everyday life, characterizing her response as a Parson's stage one.

Another fifth-grade student demonstrated this consistency in her response. In her time one reflection, she noted, "Though the man looks happy it looks like he just his cat

from a fire. It looks sad.” In her time two reason, she stated: “I gave this rating because I didn’t like the smoke but the photo look good and sad. Also the guy looked happy to have the cat.” Her explanation remained consistent; on both accounts, she was happy to see that the man had saved the cat.

Likewise, a second-grade student offered an almost identical response from time one, “I liked it because he’s saving the cat,” to time two, “I like it because the guy is saving the cat. That’s the only reason.”

The same pattern of consistency is evidenced throughout the two remaining photographs. For example, when responding to the dog photograph, one fifth-grade student noted during time one, “I love dogs they are so cute and the way his nose is sticking out it is so cute. I really really like dogs, especially puppies.” In his time two response, the same student reiterated his point: “I really like dogs and his nose is so so cute in this picture. And the dot on top of his nose is so cute and it's a puppy.” Similar to several students during time one, this child remains at a Parson’s stage one understanding. The child likes the subject of the photograph and thus, he likes the photograph.

Whereas students liked the dog as a subject, they again did not like the diving feet. Similar to the fifth-grade Photography Appreciation students, the fifth-grade control group focused on whether they liked feet or not both in time one and in time two.

For example, one fifth-grade student stated in time one: “It’s a close up of a foot! It doesn’t make much sense!” This response demonstrates a Parson’s stage one understanding; since the viewer does not like the subject, the viewer does not like the photograph. His time two response demonstrates that his opinions did not change: “It’s only a foot. Does a foot have much importance? No!”

A second-grade student communicated the same level of distaste for feet. She expressed the same sentiment in time one: “It’s somebody’s foot. You really don’t want to look at it,” as she did in time two, “It’s like not a photo I want to look at; I don’t like looking at other people’s feet.” This response displays her level of aesthetic understanding at Parson’s stage two. The child wants to see a beautiful or fascinating photograph, and does not want to see an artwork with an undesirable subject.

The responses shared by both the Photography Appreciation class and the fifth-grade control group demonstrate a pattern of consistency. Their explanations did not move through the five levels of aesthetic development. Rather, the comments stayed the same, and the same pattern was evident in the fifth-grade control group as was demonstrated through the first and second-grade control group. Students in the fifth-grade Photography Appreciation similarly did not demonstrate an increase in aesthetic understanding. When their responses did change, the nature of the response could be directly attributed to increased appreciation for some photographs.

Contrary to the control group, students in the fifth-grade Photography Production class demonstrated an increasing quality in their types of responses. Students’ responses demonstrate that their aesthetic development was most directly linked to an increase in technical awareness. The second-grade students likewise focused on each photograph’s technical merit. Their time two responses revealed new levels of aesthetic understanding.

According to the qualitative results of this study, students engaging in Photography Production tasks have a greater chance of moving through the aesthetic development stages than those who participate in Photography Appreciation tasks. Perhaps this finding can be attributed to the different levels of artistic language that

students used in each class. Future studies may seek to determine what aspect of the Photography Production tasks had the largest impact on the nature of student responses.

Parson (1987) and Housen (1983) provided stages of aesthetic development through which individuals progress. One can consider the value of each level of aesthetic understanding without ever questioning how an individual arrives at that stage. The aim of this research was to identify situations in a formal context (school) in which children naturally progress through the stages of aesthetic development. Through the student's responses, this present study provided qualitative evidence for the types of photography curricula that influence aesthetic development. From the results of this present study, art curricula can be assessed and enhanced.

References

- Barrett, T. (1990). *Criticizing photographs: An introduction to understanding images*. Mountain View: Mayfield Publishing Company.
- Cartier-Bresson, H. (1999). *The mind's eye: Writings on photography and photographers*. New York: Aperature.
- Chapman, L. (1978). *Approaches to art in education*. New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.
- Gardner, H. (1983). *The arts and human development*. New York: Wiley.
- Gibson, J.J. (1971). The information available in pictures. *Leonardo*, 4, 27-35.
- Housen, A. (1983). The eye of the beholder: Measuring aesthetic development. (Doctoral dissertation, Harvard Graduate School of Education, 1983). *Dissertations Abstracts International*, 44, 1945-1946.
- Janson and Cauman, H.W., S. (1971). *History of art for young people*. New York: Harry N. Abrams.
- Liben, L. and Szechter, L. (2002) A Social Science of the Arts: An Emerging Organizational Initiative and an Illustrative Investigation of Photography. *Qualitative Sociology*, 25, 405.
- Milbrath, C. (1998). *Patterns of artistic development in children*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Parsons, M. J. (1987). *How we understand art: A cognitive developmental account of aesthetic experience*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Pratt, F. (1985). A perspective on traditional artistic practice. In N. H. Freeman & M.V. Cox (Eds.), *Visual order* (pp. 32-58). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Appendix A

Fifth-grade - Photography Appreciation Lesson Plan, Day 1

Concept: Photographs reinterpret the world around us.

Rationale: “In order to appreciate photography...as [an] art form, children have to consider relationships among the illusions created in [this] media, the techniques by which the illusions are created, and the way in which human experience is characterized.” (Chapman, 1978, p. 279)

Pennsylvania Department of Education:

Academic Standards for the Arts and Humanities:

9.3.5 A¹

9.3.5 G²

Objectives:

Students will be able to (SWBAT) identify features of photography that make it an art form.

SWBAT critically evaluate a photograph.

SWBAT compare and contrast a photograph.

SWBAT describe and verbally communicate their feelings about a photograph.

Materials:

- H.W. Jansen quote on five different posters: “Photographs reinterpret the world around us, making us literally see it in new terms” (Janson and Cauman, 1971, p. 697)
- Chart Paper for “good photography” and “good art”
- Several Comparison Photographs
- Stickers by color and subject to divide students into discussion groups

Lesson Management:

- *Timing:* 50 minute lesson
- *Class Organization:* Students seated on the front carpet and then at four tables in clusters of six

Beginning the Lesson: (10 min)

Motivation: (2 min) In our families and with our friends, we enjoy looking at photographs to remember important events. Some photos remind us of how beautiful something was, others show us a different viewpoint of a special memory. We may look twice at a photo that is put together in a neat way. (This type of photo may cause us to reconsider the event’s implications on our life as the photo points out something we hadn’t thought of before.) We can learn to appreciate the photographs even more when

¹ Identify critical processes in the examination of works in the arts and humanities. Compare and contrast, Analyze, Interpret, Form and test hypotheses, Evaluate/form judgments

² Describe a critic’s position or opinion about selected works in the arts and humanities (e.g., student’s presentation of a critical position on Walt Disney’s *Evolution of Mickey and Minnie Mouse*).

we study different photographic elements. We will talk about what makes a “good” photograph and will look for these qualities in the photographs that we see from now on.

Connection to prior knowledge: (8 min)

- From what we you have learned so far, what makes good art? (Make a web on the board with “good art” as the center)
- Now, what do you think makes a “good photograph”? (Make a web on the chart paper with “a good photograph” as the center)

Body of the lesson: (35 min)

Modeling Procedures: (15 min)

Small Group Discussion (12 min):

- (Place the following quote on tables) Art Historian, H. W. Janson and Cauman explains what he thinks about photography in the following quote: “Photographs reinterpret the world around us, making us literally see it in new terms.” (Janson and Cauman, 1971, p. 697)
- Do you agree with him? Why or why not? Work in your small group to choose one side (Agree or Disagree) and select a spokesperson to share your side with the class (*students separate into small groups according to their colored sticker*)
- *Some possible reasons to agree: when you are taking a photograph, only one segment of the entire actual environment is seen; thus the photo reinterprets the world by causing us to focus in on what the artist viewed as important.*
- *Some possible reasons to disagree: A photograph reproduces on paper what is already in the world. Thus, it is not a reinterpretation, merely a representation.*
- *Spokespersons share with the class (8 min)*

Guided Practice Procedures: (20 min)

Activity (15 min):

Various photographs by different famous photographers are shown to the students. All responses are shared in an open-ended discussion format. So that every student has opportunity to voice their opinion, they are identified by subject-categorized stickers. For different pictures, different subject groups have the opportunity to share first.

Use the following questions to guide the discussion. Offer the first three questions to start the discussion. As needed, insert additional questions.

- Where do you think that this photograph was taken?
- How does this photograph make you feel?
- What do you like about this photograph?
- What are the noises, smells, and textures that you think you would find if you were in this photograph? How do you think that the photographer captured these sensations well in his art?
- What do you think that the scenery is like around the subject of the photograph?
- What do you think that the photographer was thinking when he/she made this art? What message does he/she want to send through his photograph?
- What would make the photo better?

- How does this relate to our comments on H.W. Janson and Cauman's quote: "Photographs reinterpret the world around us, making us literally see it in new terms."?
- How does this fit into our web-brainstorm about what makes a good photograph?

Review and Closure: *(5 min)*

Assignment for Independent Thought (5 min)

- During our next class, you will get your free-exploration pictures back. Please be prepared to use the forum of artistic critique when you look at your own photographs.
- *Review the class definition of "good art" and "good photography."* How has your idea of good art and good photography changed during today's class?/ Between today and our next class, be thinking about your definition of good art and good photography, and how it is changing as you critique your own work.

Appendix B
Fifth-grade - Photography Appreciation Lesson Plan, Day 2

Concept: Factors that influence one's appreciation of photographs

Rationale: "To take photographs means to recognize--simultaneously and within a fraction of a second--both the fact itself and the rigorous organization of visually perceived forms that give it meaning. It is putting one's head, one's eye, and one's heart on the same axis" (Cartier-Bresson, 1999, p. 16).

Pennsylvania Department of Education:

Academic Standards for the Arts and Humanities:

9.3.5 A³

9.3.5 G⁴

Objectives:

Students will be able to (SWBAT) verbally express artistic support for their opinions and impressions of personally taken photographs.

SWBAT critically evaluate a photograph.

SWBAT identify photographs that communicate a selected topic; for example "A beautiful photograph," etc.

Materials:

Chart Paper with Web of a "good photograph"

Chart Paper with Web of a "good art"

Student Photographs (negatives, double prints)

Four pieces of 9" x 6" paper per student

Free Exploration Response Sheets

Pencils, Erasers, Markers, Tape

Lesson Management:

- *Timing:* 50 minute lesson
- *Class Organization:* Students seated at four tables in clusters of six

Beginning the Lesson: (6 min)

Motivation: (2 min) During our last class we talked about what makes a "good" photograph. We also discussed how our opinions of these categories changed throughout the lessons. Today we will look for these qualities, in the photographs that you took during free-exploration.

Connection to prior knowledge: Organizing Materials: (4 min)

- Please take some time to sort through your photographs. Separate the doubles into two piles. Place one stack in the large envelope and turn it into the large bag with your

³ Identify critical processes in the examination of works in the arts and humanities. Compare and contrast, Analyze, Interpret, Form and test hypotheses, Evaluate/form judgments

⁴ Describe a critic's position or opinion about selected works in the arts and humanities (e.g., student's presentation of a critical position on Walt Disney's *Evolution of Mickey and Minnie Mouse*).

negatives. The other stack will be yours to use during the lesson. Write your name and room number on the envelope and sit at your seat when you are finished.

- Remember that this is not a time to look closely at each photograph; rather, this is a time to get your photographs organized. We need to do this quickly so that we have time to focus on the fun part of the lesson.

Body of the Lesson: (42 min)

Independent Practice: Photography Production Investigation: (23 min)

- (Students are seated with their envelope of photos and a Free Exploration Response Sheet)
- Take some time to look through your photos and find one photo for each category: (1) a beautiful photograph (2) a photograph that is important to you (3) a photograph that shows something about who you are and (4) a photograph that shows excitement (7 min)
- Place these four photos in front of you and take time to write about why you selected each photo for each category. (16 min)

Photography Production Preparation: (7 min)

- Please post each of your four selected photographs on a separate piece of 9" x 6" paper. On the back, write your name, room number, and the photograph's category.
- Here is an example of how this will look when you are finished.
 - *Provide example*

Interactive Work: "Framing" the selected photographs. (12 min)

- Remember what we did in our last class meeting with the several different photographs that we compared and critiqued? There was a series of questions that we used to guide our exploration. Today, we'll use some of those questions to guide our evaluation of personally selected photographs.
- On your matted photo, for each paper, we will fill in the four parts of the frame like this (explain the figure below)
- To get started today, think about why you originally took that photograph; record your intent below the photo.
- Next, interview your partner about their response to the photograph that you selected, record their ideas above the photograph.
- Next, think about the sensations that you had when taking this photograph and/or that an audience member has when reacting to this photograph. Record these on the right.
- Finally, consider the focus and surroundings of your photograph. Record these to the left of the photograph.
- Plan to complete this activity for two of your matted photographs today. We will have time at the beginning of next class to complete the activity for the final two photographs.

<u>Audience's Response:</u> <i>What does a friend think about the photo?</i>		
<i>Focus and Surroundings</i>	PHOTOGRAPH	<i>Sensations:</i> <i>What do you hear? Smell? Taste? Feel?</i>
<u>Photographer's Intent:</u> <i>Why did you decide to take this photograph?</i>		

Review and Closure: (2 min)**Checking for Understanding**

- At our next class meeting, we will be evaluating these photographs even more. We'll be 'framing' them in a similar way to think carefully through what we and others appreciate about the photographs.

Appendix C

Fifth-grade - Photography Appreciation Lesson Plan, Day 3

Concept: To appreciate photographs, “it is sometimes very useful to imaginatively put them back into their original contexts.”

Rationale: “To understand and appreciate photographs, it is sometimes very useful to imaginatively put them back into their original contexts, to see what the photographer has done to make a picture, to study what was included, and how, and to imagine what was excluded and why” (Barrett, 1990, p. 78).

Pennsylvania Department of Education:

Academic Standards for the Arts and Humanities:

9.3.5 A⁵

9.3.5 G⁶

Objectives:

Students will be able to (SWBAT) represent their own interpretations of the surrounding environment of one photograph.

Materials:

White computer paper

Tape

Drawing pencils

Colored pencils

Photographs taken by the students

Four pre-selected photographs (one in each of the following categories: beautiful, exciting, self expression, and important)

Lesson Management:

- *Timing:* 50 minute lesson
- *Class Organization:* Students seated at four tables in clusters of six

Beginning the Lesson: (10 min)

Connection to prior knowledge: (10 min)

- Remember what we did in our last class meeting by “framing” our selected photographs? Today, we’ll finish framing the last two photographs that you selected from your free-exploration roll.
- Remember from last time:

⁵ Identify critical processes in the examination of works in the arts and humanities. Compare and contrast, Analyze, Interpret, Form and test hypotheses, Evaluate/form judgments

⁶ Describe a critic’s position or opinion about selected works in the arts and humanities (e.g., student’s presentation of a critical position on Walt Disney’s *Evolution of Mickey and Minnie Mouse*).

- On your matted photo, for each paper, we will fill in the four parts of the frame like this (explain the figure below)
- To get started today, think about why you originally took that photograph; record your intent below the photo.
- Next, interview your partner about their response to the photograph that you selected, record their ideas above the photograph.
- Next, think about the sensations that you had when taking this photograph and/or that an audience member has when reacting to this photograph. Record these on the right.
- Finally, consider the focus and surroundings of your photograph. Record these to the left of the photograph.
- Complete this activity for your last two your matted photographs today.

Body of the lesson: (35 min)

Modeling Procedures: (5 min)

- During our last class, we had the chance to look at photographs and explore how they capture human emotion. Today, we are going to look at how they capture human experiences. We can learn to appreciate photographs even more when we think about what parts of the scene the photographer chose to capture. Today, we will get the chance to imagine and recreate what the surrounding scene of a photograph was.
- During our first photography lesson (two art classes ago), we looked at a photograph and talked about the noises, smells, textures, so on, that we thought were in the photograph. Today, we are going to try and duplicate those sensations by creating a world around a photograph.
- (Teacher shows her example of a photograph with the surrounding environment drawn in)
 - To create this photo-extension, first I made a list of the noises, smells, and textures that I imagined in this photo. I also thought about what the artist was trying to communicate. I thought about what would make the photograph better.
 - Next, I tried to continue the photo in all directions by emphasizing these different elements.

Guided Practice Procedures: (30 min)

- Select a photo from your envelope. First, brainstorm about this photo: (6 min)
 - What are the noises, smells, and textures that you think you would find if you were in this photograph? How do you think that the photographer captured these sensations well in his art?
 - What do you think that the scenery is like around the subject of the photograph?
 - What were you, the photographer thinking when he/she made this art? What message does he/she want to send through his photograph?
 - What would make the photo better?
- Now, tape the photo on your paper, any where that you desire. Using your list of ideas about the photograph, extend the photo in all directions. Imagine what the surrounding area is like, and create it. (27 min)

Assignment for Independent Practice: (5 min)

- I am handing out a disposable camera to each of you. Take home this disposable camera for Spring Break and take pictures. Use the new techniques that we learned today to make good photos! I expect that this roll of film will show the lessons that you have learned in our photo classes.
- What are some ways that you will be thinking differently when you complete this roll of film? *Students share what they have learned and what will look different.*
- Please bring the cameras back the Tuesday after Spring Break.

Appendix D

Fifth-grade - Photography Production Lesson Plan, Day 1

Concept: Photography production requires the thoughtful and skilled consideration of several variables.

Rationale: This lesson provides the necessary background knowledge that students need in order to understand how to produce better photographs.

Pennsylvania Department of Education:

Academic Standards for the Arts and Humanities:

9.1.5 J⁷

Objectives:

Students will be able to (SWBAT) explain how a photograph is produced.

SWBAT recall key events in photographic history.

SWBAT identify the basic individual parts of a camera.

SWBAT identify several photography production techniques that influence the final art work.

Materials:

35 mm Camera

Computer lab: one computer per student

Lesson Management:

- *Timing:* 50 minute lesson
- *Class Organization:*
 - Beginning Discussion: Students seated in circle on the floor
 - Students seated in four rows at the computers

Beginning the Lesson (18 min)

Motivation: (2 min) In our families and with our friends, we use cameras to capture special memories. We can keep the photographs for a long time and remember different things that we have seen or done. Today we will learn more about the beginnings of photography, the specific parts of a camera, and how pictures are produced. After this lesson, we'll be ready to learn about how to take better pictures.

Connection to Prior Knowledge: (10 min) Questions to think about: each student can share briefly from their Free Exploration experience

- What do you think will be your favorite photo from the free-exploration roll?
(Recognize the variety of purposes and goals for taking a photograph through hearing one another's priorities)

⁷ Apply traditional and contemporary technologies for producing, performing and exhibiting works in the arts or the works of others. Experiment with contemporary technologies (e.g., color fills on computers, texture methods on computers, fonts/point systems, animation techniques, video teleconferencing, **multimedia techniques**, internet access, library computer card catalogues).

- Why did you want to take the photograph then? (*Talk about why photographs are an important part of many different aspects of our life*)

Discussion (4 min):

Developing Basic Background Knowledge:

○ So, I take a picture with a camera... Now, how is an actual photograph made?

- Open-ended discussion, children field their ideas. (2 min)
- Connect to the correct explanation
- Through exposing light on a light-sensitive surface, and then placing this surface through a chemical treatment.
- How much control does the photographer have over the final photo? (2 min)
 - The photographer controls the amount of light exposed to the light-sensitive surface.
 - In order to control the amount of light that comes through a lens, the photographer changes the settings on the camera. The photographer can make the aperture, or the opening in the lens, larger or smaller. If the opening is larger, when the shutter is released, more light comes through. The cameras that we will use automatically control these settings, so we will not use them in this class. But if you enjoy these photography activities, you can plan to take more photo classes in the future to learn these parts of photography too!

Activity (5 min)

○ What are the different parts of a camera?

- Visual Aid: 35 mm camera
- I'm going to introduce the most important parts of a 35 mm camera (which is a very different thing than a digital camera)
- Basic features of a 35 mm camera:
 - *Lens*: Lets the light come in. The lens focuses the light on the film or on a mirror, which reflects the image to the viewfinder.
 - *Aperture*: The opening in the lens that controls how much light gets into the camera
 - *Shutter Release*: The control that opens the aperture, lifts up the mirror, and exposes the film to the light.
 - *Viewfinder*: The photographer looks through this part to aim, and focus the image.
 - (*Possible extensions*) *Mirror*: When the shutter is closed the mirror reflects light of the image through a prism to the photographer. When the shutter is open, the mirror moves up and the light rays fall on the film, taking the picture.
 - *Prism*: The prism is near the top inside the camera. It changes the direction of the light.

Transition from Carpet to Computers. Instructions to log into "Students" on the computer and wait for further instructions

Body of the Lesson: (27 min)

Modeling Procedures: Photography Background Knowledge: (7 min)

ON FRONT SCREEN:

<http://www.nicephore-niepce.com/>

<http://www.geog.ucsb.edu/~jeff/115a/history/niepce.html>

“Niépce (pronounced Neep-sea) is credited with producing the first successful photograph in June-July of 1827. He was fascinated with lithography, but he could not

draw, his artist son to make the images. In 1814 his son was drafted into the army to fight at Waterloo, he was left having to look for another way of obtaining images. Eventually he succeeded, calling his product Heliographs (after the Greek “of the sun”)

ON FRONT SCREEN:

http://www.artlex.com/ArtLex/p/images/photo_niepce.lg.jpg from

<http://www.artlex.com/ArtLex/p/photography/photo.-1824.html>

View from the Window at Le Gras

This is the first known photograph. There is little merit in this picture other than that fact. It is difficult to interpret; the building is on the left, a tree a third in from the left, and a barn immediately in front. The exposure lasted eight hours, so the sun had time to move from east to west, appearing to shine on both sides of the building.



20 cm x 16.5 cm, Niepce called this a "heliograph" and it is believed to be an image of the courtyard outside his house. The current belief is that he used the lens of a crude camera and a pewter plate with a few drops of bitumen (a tar like substance) on it and exposed the plate for eight hours.

IF TIME: Show some other early photographic images from website

Independent Practice: Camera Simulations: (20 min)

We've come a long way since then. Now for some practice with photography!

DIRECTIONS TO THE KODAK WEBSITE:

- Open your browser, and type in www.kodak.com
- On the white tab, click on “Taking Great Pictures.”
- Now, on the white side of the page, the second to last option: “Interactive Demos”

BEFORE YOU BEGIN, LISTEN TO THESE IMPORTANT INSTRUCTIONS:

- On this website, you will be able to take photos online and get feedback right away about your technique. There are only five different simulations; so, please take time read through the information so that you are learning what each specific exercise asks you to do. You should spend about three to five minutes on each one.

Review and Closure *(5 min)*

Checking for Understanding *(5 min)*

- What are some of the most important photography tips that you learned on the Kodak website today? Share some of these ideas with your neighbors.

Appendix E

Fifth-grade - Photography Production Lesson Plan, Day 2

Concept: Photography production techniques

Rationale: “In order to acquaint children with the artistic dimensions of [photography], activities should focus on personal identification with images in the work, on discerning how composition and lighting (or color) heighten the feeling in the work, on interpreting ideational or symbolic content in the work, and on reading the work to assume the standpoint of the artist who created it” (Chapman, 1978, p. 279).

Pennsylvania Department of Education:

Academic Standards for the Arts and Humanities:

9.1.3 A, 9.1.5 A⁸
 9.1.3 B, 9.1.5 B⁹
 9.1.3 J¹⁰, 9.1.5 J¹¹

Objectives:

Students will be able to (SWBAT) verbally express artistic support for their opinions and impressions of personally taken photographs.

SWBAT critically evaluate a photograph.

Materials:

Student Photographs (negatives, double prints)
 Four pieces of 9” x 6” paper per student
 Free Exploration Response Sheets
 Pencils, Erasers, Markers
 Sample Daguerreotypes (provided by art teacher; daguerreotypes of her family members)

Lesson Management:

- *Timing:* 50 minute lesson
- *Class Organization:* Students seated at six tables in clusters of four

Beginning the Lesson (12 min)

⁸ Know and use the elements and principles of each art form to create works in the arts and humanities: *Visual Arts Elements*: • color • form/shape • line • space • texture • value • *Visual Arts Principles*: balance • contrast • emphasis/focal point • movement/rhythm • proportion/scale • repetition • unity/harmony

⁹ Recognize, know, use and demonstrate a variety of appropriate arts elements and principles to produce, review and revise original works in the arts. *Visual Arts*: multimedia.

¹⁰ Know and use traditional and contemporary technologies for producing, performing and exhibiting works in the arts or the works of others. Know and use contemporary technologies (e.g., CDs/software, audio/sound equipment, polymers, clays, board-mixers, **photographs**, recorders).

¹¹ Apply traditional and contemporary technologies for producing, performing and exhibiting works in the arts or the works of others. Experiment with contemporary technologies (e.g., color fills on computers, texture methods on computers, fonts/point systems, animation techniques, video teleconferencing, **multimedia techniques**, internet access, library computer card catalogues).

Motivation: (2 min) Today we'll have another chance to explore photography through a photography studio setting. You will be analyzing your very own photographs. After we have the chance to do this today, you will be able to take even better photos in the future.

Connection to Prior Knowledge: (3 min)

- During our last art class, we learned about the different parts of a camera, and the history of photography. We also explored the Kodak website and used simulations on several photographs.
- Today, we also have some sample Daguerreotypes to pass around. Who can remind us why these were an important part of photography history?

Organizing Materials: (7 minutes)

- Please take some time to sort through your photographs. Separate the doubles into two piles. Place one stack in the large envelope and turn it into the large bag with your negatives. The other stack will be yours to use during the lesson. Write your name and room number on the envelope and sit at your seat when you are finished.
- Remember that this is not a time to look closely at each photograph; rather, this is a time to get your photographs organized. We need to do this quickly so that we have time to focus on the fun part of the lesson.

Body of the Lesson: (34 min)

Independent Practice: Photography Production Investigation: (27 min)

- (Students are seated with their envelope of photos and a Free Exploration Response Sheet)
- Take some time to look through your photos and find one photo for each category: (1) a beautiful photograph (2) a photograph that is important to you (3) a photograph that shows something about who you are and (4) a photograph that shows excitement (9 min)
- Place these four photos in front of you and take time to write about why you selected each photo for each category. (18 min)

Photography Production Preparation: (11 min)

- Please post each of your four selected photographs on a separate piece of 9" x 6" paper. On the back, write your name, room number, and the photograph's category.
- Here is an example of how this will look

Review and Closure (4 min)

- At our next class meeting, we will be evaluating these photographs even more. We will use the information that we learn at the Kodak website to critique our own photographs.

Appendix F

Fifth-grade - Photography Production Lesson Plan, Day 3

Concept: Photography production analysis

Rationale: “In order to acquaint children with the artistic dimensions of [photography], activities should focus on personal identification with images in the work, on discerning how composition and lighting (or color) heighten the feeling in the work, on interpreting ideational or symbolic content in the work, and on reading the work to assume the standpoint of the artist who created it” (Chapman, 1978, p. 279).

Pennsylvania Department of Education:

Academic Standards for the Arts and Humanities:

9.1.5 A¹²

9.1.5 B¹³

9.1.5 J¹⁴

Objectives:

SWBAT analyze the photographs that they produced according to specific photography production guidelines

SWBAT articulate their understandings and learnings about photography

Materials:

Computer lab: one computer per student

KODAK’s suggestions for good photographs on Kodak website

Photographs taken by the students

Four pre-selected photographs (one in each of the following categories: beautiful, exciting, self expression, and important)

Lesson Management:

- *Timing:* 50 minute lesson
- *Class Organization:* Students seated in circle, and students seated at their computer.

Beginning the Lesson (8 min)

Motivation: (1 min) We’ll learn a great way to plan out what we would like to photograph. We’ll also learn about different ways to make a better photograph. After these lessons, every time that we take a picture, we will be able to use a better technique.

¹² Know and use the elements and principles of each art form to create works in the arts and humanities: *Visual Arts Elements*: • color • form/shape • line • space • texture • value • *Visual Arts Principles*: balance • contrast • emphasis/focal point • movement/rhythm • proportion/scale • repetition • unity/harmony

¹³ Recognize, know, use and demonstrate a variety of appropriate arts elements and principles to produce, review and revise original works in the arts. *Visual Arts*: multimedia.

¹⁴ Apply traditional and contemporary technologies for producing, performing and exhibiting works in the arts or the works of others. Experiment with contemporary technologies (e.g., color fills on computers, texture methods on computers, fonts/point systems, animation techniques, video teleconferencing, **multimedia techniques**, internet access, library computer card catalogues).

Connection to Prior Knowledge: (7 min)

- During our photography lessons, we have learned about how to compose good pictures. Before we learned these different ways to take a good photograph, you all had the chance to take a roll of film. We developed those pictures for you, and you selected four pictures from four categories from this pile.

- Let's review some of the things we learned about how to compose a good photo: (students may share any of the following new understandings from the interactive photography lessons online)

- **Shooting vertical or horizontal:** Kodak suggests that we “Hold the camera vertically to take pictures of tall buildings, waterfalls, or a person; hold the camera horizontally for groups of people, [and] cars”

- **Choosing a main point of interest:** “Although you know what your subject is, it can be hard for a viewer to determine your intent if too many elements in your picture make it confusing. Eliminate all unimportant elements by moving closer, zooming in, or choosing a different shooting angle.”

- **Adjusting your angle of view** “For the most complimentary portrait, shoot at your subject's eye level. However, if you want to have some creative fun, change your angle of view. Change your position to emphasize or exaggerate how big or small your subject is. Crouch down and shoot up at someone and that person towers over you. Shoot down on your pet and it seems so comically small. You can also move your camera right or left only a few feet to change the composition dramatically.”

- **Placing the subject off-center** “Putting the subject off-center often makes the composition more dynamic and interesting. ...Even if your subject fills the frame, the most important part of the subject (for example, the eyes in a portrait) should not be dead center.”

- Follow the rule of thirds. An easy way to compose off-center pictures is to imagine a tick-tack-toe board over your viewfinder. Avoid placing your subject in that center square, and you have followed the rule of thirds. Try to place your subject along one of the imaginary lines that divides your frame.

- Watch the horizon. Just as an off-center subject is usually best, so is an off-center—and straight—horizon line. Avoid cutting your picture in half by placing the horizon in the middle of the picture. To accent spaciousness, keep the horizon low in the picture. To suggest closeness, position the horizon high in your picture.”

- **Using leading lines** “Select a camera angle where the natural lines of the scene lead the viewers' eyes into the picture and toward your main center of interest. You can find such a line in a road, a fence, even a shadow. Diagonal lines are dynamic; curved lines are flowing and graceful. You can often find the right line by moving around and choosing an appropriate angle.”

- **Avoiding distracting backgrounds** “Select an uncomplicated background that does not compete with your subject. Bright colors and text (for example, store signs) create the biggest problems. Be especially aware of what is behind your subject in a portrait so that branches don't accidentally become antlers.”

- **Including foreground objects** “When taking pictures of landscapes, include an object, such as a tree or boulder, in the foreground. Elements in the foreground add a sense of depth to the picture. A person in the foreground helps establish a sense of scale.

Sometimes you can use the foreground elements to "frame" your subject. Overhanging

tree branches, a doorway, or an arch can give a picture the depth it needs to make it more than just another snapshot.”

Body of the Lesson: (30 min)

Modeling Procedures: Photography Production Investigation: (3 min)

- Here’s a photograph that one student took (student volunteer). I’m going to analyze it according to the suggestions that we have. (Analyze photograph)

Guided Practice Procedures: Becoming the Photographer: (27 min)

- Now, just as I analyzed my photograph, you are going to take four of your photos, from the pre-selected categories, and analyze them. You will bring your packet to a computer and surf through the Kodak website, reading through the “Top ten great tips for good photography.” When you find something that shows the strength or weakness of your photograph, record it.
- Use the area around your matted photograph to record your work. You can record off the composition strategies that you used, or, that you should have used.
- Spend about 5-7 minutes on each photograph
- STUDENTS TRANSITION TO COMPUTERS, log on to kodak.com and begin exploring the site

Review and Closure (12 min)

Checking for Understanding (8 min)

- (Students gather back on the carpet in a circle with their analyzed photographs) In our large group, each person will share one observation that they commented on about their photographs. Be sure to hold up the photo that you are referring to, and point to the ways that you liked the composition or would want to change the composition.

Assignment for Independent Practice (4 min)

- I am handing out a disposable camera to each of you. Take home this disposable camera for Spring Break and take pictures. Use the new techniques that we learned today to make good photos! I expect that this roll of film will show the lessons that you have learned in our photo classes. Please bring the cameras back the Tuesday after Spring Break.

Appendix G

Second-grade - Photography Production Lesson Plan, Day 1

Concept: Photography production techniques

Rationale: “In order to acquaint children with the artistic dimensions of [photography], activities should focus on personal identification with images in the work, on discerning how composition and lighting (or color) heighten the feeling in the work, on interpreting ideational or symbolic content in the work, and on reading the work to assume the standpoint of the artist who created it” (Chapman, 1978, p. 279).

Pennsylvania Department of Education:

Academic Standards for the Arts and Humanities:

9.1.3 A¹⁵

9.1.3 B¹⁶

9.1.3 J¹⁷

Objectives:

SWBAT identify the different parts of a camera.

SWBAT use their hands as a viewfinder to select a scene to be photographed.

Materials:

35 mm camera

Disposable Cameras

Poster of a camera

List of camera parts

Viewfinder

Cardboard tubes

Lesson Management:

- *Timing:* 40 minute lesson
- *Class Organization:* Students seated in a circle at computer lab, facing the big screen.

Beginning the Lesson (5 min)

Connection to Prior Knowledge and Motivation: (3 min) During our last art class we had a chance to look at lots of different photos. We colored in faces that showed if we liked the photos or not. Today we’ll have another chance to do something more with photography. We’ll learn all about the parts of a camera. We’ll also learn a great way to plan out what we want to photograph. After these lessons, every time that we take a photograph, we will know just how to plan out our picture.

Body of the Lesson: (35 min)

¹⁵ Know and use the elements and principles of each art form to create works in the arts and humanities: *Visual Arts Elements:* • color • form/shape • line • space • texture • value • *Visual Arts Principles:* balance • contrast • emphasis/focal point • movement/rhythm • proportion/scale • repetition • unity/harmony

¹⁶ Recognize, know, use and demonstrate a variety of appropriate arts elements and principles to produce, review and revise original works in the arts. *Visual Arts:* multimedia.

¹⁷ Know and use traditional and contemporary technologies for producing, performing and exhibiting works in the arts or the works of others. Know and use contemporary technologies (e.g., CDs/software, audio/sound equipment, polymers, clays, board-mixers, **photographs**, recorders).

Modeling Procedures: Basic Parts of the Camera: (5 min)

- *The teacher points to each part of the camera as it is explained. Camera is passed around after explanation. The definitions below are for a resource, the teacher will present each part in age-appropriate language.*
- *Lens:* Lets the light come in. The lens focuses the light on the film or on a mirror, which reflects the image to the viewfinder.
- *Aperture:* The opening in the lens that controls how much light gets into the camera
- *Shutter Speed:* Controls how long the light hits the film.
- *Shutter Release:* The control that opens the aperture, lifts up the mirror, and exposes the film to the light.
- *Viewfinder:* The photographer looks through this part to aim, and focus the image.
- *Mirror:* When the shutter is closed the mirror reflects light of the image through a prism to the photographer. When the shutter is open, the mirror moves up and the light rays fall on the film, taking the picture.
- *Prism:* The prism is near the top inside the camera. It changes the direction of the light.

Guided Practice: (20 min)

Now, turn your attention to the front screen.

ON FRONT SCREEN:

<http://www.nicephore-niepce.com/>

<http://www.geog.ucsb.edu/~jeff/115a/history/niepce.html>

“Niépce (pronounced Neep-sea) is credited with producing the first successful photograph in June-July of 1827. He was fascinated with lithography, but he could not draw, his artist son to make the images. In 1814 his son was drafted into the army to fight at Waterloo, he was left having to look for another way of obtaining images. Eventually he succeeded, calling his product Heliographs (after the Greek “of the sun”).”

ON FRONT SCREEN:

http://www.artlex.com/ArtLex/p/images/photo_niepce.lg.jpg from

<http://www.artlex.com/ArtLex/p/photography/photo.-1824.html>

View from the Window at Le Gras

This is the first known photograph. There is little merit in this picture other than that fact. It is difficult to interpret; the building is on the left, a tree a third in from the left, and a barn immediately in front. The exposure lasted eight hours, so the sun had time to move from east to west, appearing to shine on both sides of the building.



20 cm x 16.5 cm, Niepce called this a "heliograph" and it is believed to be an image of the courtyard outside his house. The current belief is that he used the lens of a crude camera and a pewter plate with a few drops of bitumen (a tar like substance) on it and exposed the plate for eight hours.

ON FRONT SCREEN

www.kodak.com

- Here are some ideas that Kodak has about how to take good photographs
- Look through the top ten tips with students

Independent Practice: Free-Exploration Reactions: (10 min)

- What do you think will be your favorite photo from the free-exploration roll?
(Recognize the variety of purposes and goals for taking a photograph through hearing one another's priorities)
- Why did you want to take the photograph then? *(Talk about why photographs are an important part of many different aspects of our life)*
- Students have the opportunity to share about their favorite pictures that they took.

Appendix H

Second-grade - Photography Production Lesson Plan, Day 2

Concept: Photography production techniques

Rationale: “In order to acquaint children with the artistic dimensions of [photography], activities should focus on personal identification with images in the work, on discerning how composition and lighting (or color) heighten the feeling in the work, on interpreting ideational or symbolic content in the work, and on reading the work to assume the standpoint of the artist who created it” (Chapman, 1978, p. 279).

Pennsylvania Department of Education:

Academic Standards for the Arts and Humanities:

9.1.3 A¹⁸

9.1.3 B¹⁹

9.1.3 J²⁰

Objectives:

SWBAT identify and recall specific techniques used to take a good photograph.

SWBAT use their hands as a viewfinder to select a scene to be photographed.

SWBAT identify one good/favorite photograph and one poor/least favorite photograph from their film and support their selection using language from the Kodak website

Materials:

Prints from Disposable Cameras

Second-grade Free Exploration Response Sheets

Poster of a “How to take a good photograph”

Tape, Pencils, Markers

Lesson Management:

- *Timing:* 40 minute lesson
- *Class Organization:* Students seated in a circle with the teacher, and at tables.

Beginning the Lesson (7 min)

Connection to Prior Knowledge and Motivation: (7 min) During our last art class we had a chance to learn all about the parts of a camera and about important people in photography. We also visited the Kodak website and learned a great way to plan out photographs. What are some things that you learned about taking a good photograph?

¹⁸ Know and use the elements and principles of each art form to create works in the arts and humanities: *Visual Arts Elements:* • color • form/shape • line • space • texture • value • *Visual Arts Principles:* balance • contrast • emphasis/focal point • movement/rhythm • proportion/scale • repetition • unity/harmony

¹⁹ Recognize, know, use and demonstrate a variety of appropriate arts elements and principles to produce, review and revise original works in the arts. *Visual Arts:* multimedia.

²⁰ Know and use traditional and contemporary technologies for producing, performing and exhibiting works in the arts or the works of others. Know and use contemporary technologies (e.g., CDs/software, audio/sound equipment, polymers, clays, board-mixers, **photographs**, recorders).

- Students share ideas, which are recorded on the “Taking a Good Photograph” poster

Body of the Lesson: (27 min)

Modeling Procedures: Using a Viewfinder: (7 min)

Photography Scenes Investigation

- Who wants to play a game!? (YAY!) Well, we are going to play a little game called “I SPY a photo spot.”
 - First, What shape does a photograph usually come in? (A Square! A Rectangle!)
 - Now, if we wanted to plan ahead before we take a photo, we would want to know what kind of stuff that we can see would fit onto a rectangular photo.
 - Well, we are extra lucky! I know a little secret. Today, when you walked into class, you all had just what you will need to focus on your photo. Can anyone think of what it is?! Well, you can use your own hands as a viewfinder. Everyone in the class can try to create a viewfinder with their hands. (Teacher demonstrates and children make viewfinders with their hands at their table)
 - Teacher shows how to explore the room with the viewfinder, how to change the size and horizontal/vertical of the viewfinder.
 - Now, looking through your own viewfinder, I want us to look around the room and quietly find a scene that would make a good picture. When you have found one, keep looking through your hands at it.
 - *Several students share what part of the room they chose, and talk through the composition of the photograph. This encourages them to use photographic language.*

Guided Practice Procedures: Critiquing Personal Photographs: (20 min)

- Today, I am going to return your photographs to you, and would like you to sort through them. Thinking about the things that we know make a GOOD photograph, look through the pictures you took and find one picture for this category; this picture goes in the smiley face category for your favorite photo. After you do this, look for one photograph that you think was NOT A GOOD photograph; this picture goes in the frowning face category for your least favorite photo.
- As you are selecting these photographs, be ready to explain why you chose each photo.

Review and Closure (6 min)

Checking for Understanding (4 min)

- (Back inside) To review everything that we have learned today, let’s all come and sit in a circle.
- When we take our photos, there are specific things that we can remember to do in order to have a nice picture turn out. What are some of the things that we learned today about this?
- What are some of the reasons that you selected your GOOD photograph and the one that was not good?

As students share, note the language and word selection that they use.

Assignment for Independent Practice (3 min)

- Today, when you are at home, I want you to be looking for photographs to take. Use your hands as a viewfinder and think about the different ways that you can make a good photograph with where you are standing.

Appendix I

Second-grade - Photography Production Lesson Plan, Day 3

Concept: Photography production analysis.

Rationale: “In order to acquaint children with the artistic dimensions of [photography], activities should focus on personal identification with images in the work, on discerning how composition and lighting (or color) heighten the feeling in the work, on interpreting ideational or symbolic content in the work, and on reading the work to assume the standpoint of the artist who created it.” (Chapman, 1978. p. 279)

Pennsylvania Department of Education:

Academic Standards for the Arts and Humanities:

9.1.3 A²¹

9.1.3 B²²

9.1.3 J²³

Objectives:

SWBAT analyze the photographs that they produced

Materials:

List of KODAK’s suggestions for good photographs
Photographs taken by the students

Lesson Management:

- *Timing:* 40 minute lesson
- *Class Organization:* Students gathered in the computer lab for the first twenty minutes. Then, seated in a circle for discussion and sharing in the art room.

Beginning the Lesson (5 min)

Motivation and Connection to Prior Knowledge: (5 min) After our last class, we learned a whole lot about how to take photographs. Today you are going to look at your very own photographs. After we do this today, you will be able to take even better photos in the future. I’m passing out the photographs that you chose as your favorite and least favorite from your own roll. As we are learning more about photography on the Kodak website today, look at your own photographs and compare them to the skills that we are learning about good photography.

²¹ Know and use the elements and principles of each art form to create works in the arts and humanities: *Visual Arts Elements:* • color • form/shape • line • space • texture • value • *Visual Arts Principles:* balance • contrast • emphasis/focal point • movement/rhythm • proportion/scale • repetition • unity/harmony

²² Recognize, know, use and demonstrate a variety of appropriate arts elements and principles to produce, review and revise original works in the arts. *Visual Arts:* multimedia.

²³ Know and use traditional and contemporary technologies for producing, performing and exhibiting works in the arts or the works of others. Know and use contemporary technologies (e.g., CDs/software, audio/sound equipment, polymers, clays, board-mixers, **photographs**, recorders).

Independent Practice: Camera Simulations: (25 min) Now for some practice with photography! On this website, we will be able to take photos online and get feedback right away about our technique. There are six different simulations; so, we're going to take time read through the information so that we are learning what each specific exercise asks us to do. We'll spend about five minutes on each one.

- Remember, when we get back to class, we are going to share what we noticed about our own photographs as compared to the tips that Kodak gives us. So, be thinking in your mind what you want to share about your photograph. What would you do differently next time? What would you decide to change, or, what would you keep the same if you took that photograph again? (Model one example of thinking ahead about this)
- Students volunteer reactions to the lessons learned on the following five Kodak "Interactive Demos:"
 - Try using a plain background
 - Try moving it from the middle
 - Try locking the focus
 - Try knowing your flash's range
 - Try watching the light
 - Troubleshooting your pictures

Review and Closure (10 min)

Checking for Understanding (10 min)

- What are some of the most important photography tips that you learned on the Kodak website today? What did you decide you would do differently, or, that you would keep the same in the photographs that you chose from your rolls last time?

Assignment for Independent Practice (3 min)

- Today, when you are at home, I want you to be looking for photographs to take. Use your hands as a viewfinder and think about the different ways that you can make a nice photograph with where you are standing.

DIDN'T HAVE TIME FOR THIS:

- Let's review some of the things we learned about how to compose a good photo. We're going to check out some different options. Does everyone have their viewfinder ready? (7 min)
 - **Shooting vertical or horizontal:** Kodak suggests that we "Hold the camera vertically to take pictures of tall buildings, waterfalls, or a person; hold the camera horizontally for groups of people, [and] cars"
 - **Choosing a main point of interest:** "Although you know what your subject is, it can be hard for a viewer to determine your intent if too many elements in your picture make it confusing. Eliminate all unimportant elements by moving closer, zooming in, or choosing a different shooting angle."
 - If I want Bobby to be the main part of this photograph, do you think it would be better if I sat him in front of this [cluttered] part of the classroom, or in this [open area] section of the class.
 - **Adjusting your angle of view** "For the most complimentary portrait, shoot at your subject's eye level. However, if you want to have some creative fun, change your angle of

view. Change your position to emphasize or exaggerate how big or small your subject is. Crouch down and shoot up at someone and that person towers over you. Shoot down on your pet and it seems so comically small. You can also move your camera right or left only a few feet to change the composition dramatically.”

- I want to make this chair look huge, so I think I will kneel down and take the picture from this angle, instead of straight on.

- **Avoiding distracting backgrounds** “Select an uncomplicated background that does not compete with your subject. Bright colors and text (for example, store signs) create the biggest problems. Be especially aware of what is behind your subject in a portrait so that branches don't accidentally become antlers.”

- If I were to take a picture of Alex when he stood near this plant, I would not put him right in front of it, because he might suddenly grow plant antlers.

Appendix J

Fifth-grade Rating Instructions and Sheet

Fifth-grade Introduction: “Hi, my name is Miss Cannon and I will be teaching you a few different things about photography in art class this year. Do you all know about photographs? They are the pictures taken with cameras. You’ve probably seen lots of photographs. You’ve probably seen some that your family has taken and some in magazines and newspapers. There are lots of different kinds of photos. We’re going to be looking at photos during the year and doing different things with them. But to begin, I want to learn more about what *you* think of some photographs.

Different people like different photos, and I want to learn more about what each of *you* likes. There are no right or wrong answers to this. Different people like different things, and that’s just fine. I’m trying to learn more about what different students like. So I expect that for any one picture, some of you may like it a lot, and other may not like it at all, and others of you will think it’s just ok – not something you like a lot or dislike a lot.

Today, I brought a collection of different photographs. So that you can tell me how much you like each picture, I brought a rating sheet for you to use. Let’s take a look at this sheet. The numbers on the side, 1-25, identify each photograph that you will see. These across the top are the rating numbers. (Rating sheet example displayed on the front screen). On this sheet, you will be able to choose from a rating of 1 to a rating of 7. If you really dislike the photo, you would mark a 1 under the (1), if you don’t like the photo very much, you would mark a 2 under (2), if you sort-of don’t like the photo, you would mark a 3 under (3), if you don’t really feel one way or the other about the photo, mark a 4 under (4), if you kind-of like the photo, mark a 5 under (5), if you do like the photo very well, mark a 6 under (6), or, if you *really* like the photo, mark a 7 under (7). Remember, the more you *like* the photo, the higher the number you would use; the *less* you like the photo, the lower the number you would use. I am very interested in exactly how much *you* like or don’t like the photograph, so please try to find the right number to show your opinion on the scale of 1 to 7.

Let’s try using the scale with a food, just to see how it works. There are a few different foods that some people kind-of like, and other people don’t like at all. For example, how much do you like raisins? I like raisins pretty well, but, I am not too crazy about them, but I still like them a little bit. So, I would choose rating 5. How many people would rate raisins as 1, meaning you *really* don’t like them? 2? 3? 4? 5? 6? 7?

Wow, did everyone notice the range in people’s different preferences for raisins? Just as you all had different feelings about the raisins, I’m sure there will be some pictures that some of you like and some of you don’t, and there will be other pictures that you kind-of like. That’s fine. I’m just trying to understand about how people feel about photographs. So today I am going to show you some photographs and I am going to ask you to tell me about how you feel about them.

Before we look at some sample photographs, I am going to hand out the ratings sheet. (Hand out sheets). Please print your name at the top of this paper. Check and make sure

that you have your name on your paper? Okay, let's look together at the ratings sheet. Do you notice how every other line is shaded in gray? This is very important because it will help you keep your ratings organized. It is very important that you carefully focus on one line for your rating response at a time.

When I show a photograph, I will say what number the photograph is, and you will need to look at the number on the left column to make sure that you are telling me how you feel about the photograph that we are focused on. Please be very careful that you do not mark two numbers in the same line. Does anyone have a question about how they will use the sheets to tell me how much you like each photograph?

Now, I will show you nine sample photographs. Even though you will not tell me how you feel about these photographs, these are the kinds of photographs that you will be seeing. This is just to give you an idea of the kinds of pictures you will be seeing. This is also a time to practice not reacting out loud to the photographs. If you really like the photo, it's important that you do not gasp like this (*gasp*). If you really don't like the photo, it's important that you do not gasp like this (*gasp*). If you respond like this it may distract your neighbor, so please practice quietly thinking about how much *you* like the photograph. Please put your pencil on your desk, and look up to the front of the room as I show the sample photographs.

(Show sample photos)

Okay, now that you have an idea of what these photographs are like, are there any more questions before I show you the first photograph? Remember, you will see 25 different photographs, and you will be using the numbers to tell me whether you like them or not. Remember, this is just about how **YOU** feel about the photograph. There aren't any right or wrong answers here. I am just trying to find out how different children feel about different photos. This is photograph 1, please find it on your sheet. You should be on a white (or grey) line. (Continue for each photograph, specifying both the number and whether the line is white or grey).

(Complete Ratings)

Now that you have seen all of the photographs, I am going to show you three of them again, so that you can explain a bit more about your why you liked or did not like the photograph. (Hand out paper) On the back of your paper, there is room for you to record your responses. The photograph number that I will show you is listed so that you can look back at how much you liked or did not like that photograph. The statement says: "I gave this photograph a rating of **BLANK** because..." Please write down the rating that you gave in the blank space, and then explain why you chose that rating. Tell us what you think about the photograph. If you gave it a high rating, why do you like it? If you gave it a low rating, why do you not like it? Take your time with your responses and use as much space as you need. Remember, look back at how much you liked those photographs, and write down the rating number that you chose. Please explain what you think about the photograph, why you like it or not. Please do not feel too rushed to get all of your ideas out; explain your thoughts as much as you can. Why do you like the photo, or not like the photo?

(Complete Explanations)

Now, I would like for you to check the front and make sure that your name is on the front of the paper. I will collect each paper.

Every student teacher at the PDS program gets to do a project for the year. For my project, I will use some of the information that you give me in class during the art lessons. I also would like to use this information for a big graduation paper that I am writing. Is it okay with you if I use this for my graduation paper? (Melanie Fink, the art teacher, will witness the verbal assent)

Name: _____

	1 (lowest rating)	2	3	4	5	6	7 (highest rating)
1							
2							
3							
4							
5							
6							
7							
8							
9							
10							
11							
12							
13							
14							
15							
16							
17							
18							
19							
20							
21							
22							
23							
24							
25							

Name: _____

Photograph 2

I gave this photograph a rating of ____ because _____

Photograph 5

I gave this photograph a rating of ____ because _____

Photograph 23

I gave this photograph a rating of ____ because _____

Appendix K

First- and Second-grade Rating Instructions and Sheet Sample

Second-grade Introduction: “Hi, my name is Miss Cannon and I will be teaching you a few different things about photography in art class this year. Do you all know about photographs? They are the pictures taken with cameras. You’ve probably seen lots of photographs. You’ve probably seen some that your family has taken and some in magazines and newspapers. There are lots of different kinds of photos. We’re going to be looking at photos during the year and doing different things with them. But to begin, I want to learn more about what *you* think of some photographs.

Different people like different photos, and I want to learn more about what each of *you* likes. There are no right or wrong answers to this. Different people like different things, and that’s just fine. I’m trying to learn more about what different children like. So I am sure that for the pictures that I show, some of you may really like and, and your friends might not like it at all. Some other people will think that the photograph is just ok.

Today, I brought a bunch of different photographs. I want you to be able to tell me how much you like each picture. That’s what this sheet is for; it has lots of different faces on it, so that you can tell me how you feel about each photograph. When you choose a certain face that shows how much you like or don’t like a photo, you will put an “x” through it, just like this (demonstrate on the chalkboard where a neutral face has been drawn). Let’s look at the different faces. (Rating example displayed on the front screen). Do you see this really happy face? If you put an “X” on this face (☺), it would mean that you *really* liked the photograph I was showing you. How about this one? If you put an “X” on this face (☹), it would mean that you *really* did **not** like the photograph I was showing you.

On this sheet, you can choose from seven different faces. Let’s talk about each one: If you *really* don’t like the photo, you would choose this one (point to face 1), if you don’t like the photo very much (point to face 2), if you sort-of don’t like the photo (point to face 3), if you don’t really feel one way or the other about the photo (point to face 4), if you kind-of like the photo (point to face 5), if you do like the photo very well (point to face 6), or, if you *really* like the photo (point to face 7). Remember, if you *really* like the photo, put an “X” on the ☺ face. Remember, the more you *like* the photo, the happier the face you would pick; the *less* you like the photo, the sadder the face you would pick. I am really interested in knowing exactly how much *you* like or don’t like the photograph, so use the right face for how much you like the photo or not. Remember, there aren’t any right or wrong answers. This is just about how much *you* like each photo.

Let’s try using the scale with a food, just to see how it works. There are some foods that some people like to eat, and that other people don’t like to eat at all. For example, how much do you like raisins? I like raisins pretty well, but, I am not too

crazy about them, but I still like them a little bit. So, I would choose this face (5). How many people would rate raisins as ☹, meaning you *really* don't like them? face 2 (point to the face for each)? 3? 4? 5? 6? 7?

Wow, did everyone notice the different ways that we all like and don't like raisins? (OR, say, Wow, we all feel pretty similar about raisins. Some of us would put an "x" on this face (point to it) and some of us would put an "x" on this face (point to it). When we look at the pictures, we will all have different ideas about how much we like each photograph.) That's just like how we will all have different feelings about the pictures. I'm sure there will be some pictures that some of you like and that some of you don't, and there will be other pictures that you kind-of like.

Before we look at some sample photographs, I am going to hand out the ratings sheet. (Hand out sheets). Please print your name at the top of this paper. Check again to make sure that your name is on the top of your paper. Let's look together at the ratings sheet. Do you see that every other line is shaded in gray? This is very important because it will help you keep your ideas in order. It is very important that you look at one line at a time when we show you the photos.

When I show a photograph, I will say what number the photograph is. It's your job to put your finger on the number that I say so that you are on the right line. We don't want to mark two ratings in the same line. Does anyone have a question about how to use this worksheet?

Now, I will show you nine photographs that show you what kinds of photographs you will rate later today. Even though you will not tell me how you feel about these photographs, these are the kinds of photographs that you will be seeing. This is just to give you an idea of the kinds of pictures you will be seeing. This is also a time to practice not reacting out loud to the photographs. If you really like the photo, it's important that you do not gasp like this (*gasp*). If you really don't like the photo, it's important that you do not gasp like this (*gasp*). If you respond like this it may distract your neighbor, so please practice quietly thinking about how much *you* like the photograph. So, now, put your pencil on your desk, and look up to the front of the room as I show the example photographs.

(Show sample photos)

Okay, now that know what these photographs are like, does anyone have a question? Remember, you will look at 25 different photographs, and use the faces to let me know how much you like them or don't like them. This is photograph 1, please put your finger on the 1 on your sheet, is this line white or grey? "White!" That's right. (Continue for each photograph, noting if it is white or grey).

(Complete ratings)

Now, everyone should check their paper and make sure that their name is on the first sheet. Are all of the names there? Great! I will come around and collect the papers from each of you.

Thank you for rating the photos, I look forward to seeing what you think about them. Every student teacher gets to do a project for the year. For my project, I will use some of the information that you give me in class during the art lessons. When I graduate from college, I would like to use your ideas for a big graduation paper. Is it okay with you if I use this for my graduation paper? (Melanie Fink, the art teacher, will witness the verbal assent)

Name: _____

	1 	2 	3 	4 	5 	6 	7 
1	1 	2 	3 	4 	5 	6 	7 
2	1 	2 	3 	4 	5 	6 	7 
3	1 	2 	3 	4 	5 	6 	7 
4	1 	2 	3 	4 	5 	6 	7 
5	1 	2 	3 	4 	5 	6 	7 

Appendix L

“Reasons” Interview with First- and Second-grade Children

For each Interviewer:

Materials:

- three photos, each in plastic protector
- copy of one page of the rating form showing the 7 faces
- the child’s OWN answer sheet already filled out with the child’s rating.
- clipboard to write on in case can’t have table.

Instructions:

BEFORE the child comes, be sure that the top of the child’s form is filled out, and the ratings that the child gave are filled in on each page so you are ready to interview children as efficiently as possible.

Do you remember seeing some photographs in class? Do you remember using these faces [**show rating form**] to show how much you liked each one? Do you remember that if you liked the picture a lot, you marked this face (point to 7 face) and if you really didn’t like it you marked this face (point to 1 face) and if you felt sort of in the middle, sort of “so-so” you marked this one (neutral 4 face) and so on? (**Go through all faces if needed.**)

Today I am talking with children in your class so I can understand what they liked or didn’t like about some of the pictures. Because we only have a few minutes, I’m only going to ask you about three of them. Just as before, there are no right or wrong answers. I’m just trying to find out what things children like or don’t like about the pictures. I’ll be writing down what you say (**try to get verbatim answers!**) because that will help me remember. Okay?

Name: _____ Interviewer: _____ Date: _____

So, for this first one (**Man with Kitten**) you picked this (face/rating) _____ which meant that you _____ (meaning of selected face). Can you tell me what you liked (or didn't like) about this picture?

OK, now lets look at this one (**Diving feet**). For this one, you picked this (face/rating) _____ which meant that you _____ (meaning of selected face). Can you tell me what you liked (or didn't like) about this picture?

Now here's the last one. (**Dog**) For this one, you picked this (face/rating) _____ which meant that you _____ (meaning of selected face). Can you tell me what you liked (or didn't like) about this picture?

Appendix M

Academic Vita of Amy Cannon

Amy Cannon

814-238-2879

814-238-5175

E-mail: amc311@psu.eduElectronic Teaching Portfolio: www.personal.psu.edu/amc311

107 Ridgewood Circle

State College, PA 16803

Education:

B.S. in Elementary Education (May 2005), academic concentration: Math
The Pennsylvania State University, Schreyer Honors College

Thesis Title:

Children's Aesthetic Understanding: Developing Interpretations of Photography

Thesis Supervisor:

Lynn S. Liben, Distinguished Professor of Psychology

*Teaching Experience:*Professional Development School Year Long Intern, 8/04 – 6/05, State College, PA

- Plan and implement lessons and units for kindergarten in accordance with state and national standards
- Conduct informal and formal assessments with organization, purpose, and detail
- Teach various aspects of a balanced literacy program with emphasis on phonics, vocabulary, comprehension, fluency and phonemic awareness
- Lead and differentiate guided reading for five different groups
- Conduct DIBELS assessments after completing training from Instructional Support Staff
- Teach math through Investigations®, emphasizing the use of manipulatives
- Teach science utilizing a hands-on, inquiry-based approach
- Teach social studies through integration with literacy centers
- Create and lead photography learning enrichment unit for second and fifth-grade
- Communicate with parents through parent, child and teacher goal setting conferences, weekly newsletters, and family partnership activities
- Implement a positive discipline plan, promoting student responsibility, conflict resolution skills, and student accountability
- Develop interventions for academically and/or socially at-risk students and assess progress through year
- Collaborative and active member of Individualized Education Program (IEP) meeting, weekly kindergarten team meetings and monthly staff meetings

- Lead fifth-grade literature discussion group: design daily literature circle activities that support and extend fifth-grade social studies and literacy concepts.
- Collect detailed anecdotal notes and compose assessments used for report cards
- Guide students in leading discussions and setting personal, attainable literacy goals

Work Experience:

Summer Youth Director for Grace Lutheran Church, 6/04 – 8/04, State College, PA

- Designed weekly summer youth activities for 30 to 50 students
- Supervised 25 middle school leaders for an elementary summer camp of 200 students
- Taught week-long art camp for diverse group of 15 primary-aged students

Summer Camp Counselor at Eagle Lake Camp, 5/03 – 8/03, Colorado Springs, CO

- Attended to, motivated, and counseled young people ages eight to seventeen
- Supervised and facilitated community building activities for children
- Cared for seven diabetic girls for one camp session

Water Safety Instructor, 6/02 – 8/02, 1/03 – 3/03, 6/04 – 8/04, State College, PA

- Developed weekly lesson plans to assist children's swimming development
- Introduced and enforce safe water habits

Community Service Involvement:

English as a Second Language (ESL) Tutor, 1/04 – 5/04, University Park, PA

- Designed bi-weekly language learning lessons for Penn State ESL graduate student
- Volunteered with the Pennsylvania Adult Literacy Tutor Program

Volunteers in Public Schools Tutor, 3/03 – 5/03 and 9/04 – 1/05, State College, PA

- Tutored two high school students in Advanced Geometry and Advanced Algebra II

Schreyer Honors College Mentor, 8/02 – 10/02 and 8/03 – 10/03, University Park, PA

- Provided insight regarding academic and extracurricular collegiate experience
- Introduced incoming Honors students to Penn State

Penn State Outing Club Field Guide

- Performed certification requirements to safely guide outdoor adventure trips

- Completed Wilderness Instructor Leadership Development (WILD)
- Prepared and led outdoor canoeing trips

Second Mile College Friend

- Built friendship with and encouraged at-risk youths

International Journey's Story Hour

- Researched and presented a country to children and at the local library

Grants Received:

Phi Beta Kappa Thesis Research Grant in the Liberal Arts
 Paul Cornwell Memorial Fund
 Schreyer Honors College Thesis Research Grant
 Undergraduate Research Fund

Awards:

Student Marshal for The College of Education
 The Evan Pugh Academic Excellence Award, junior and senior year
 Dr. Gilbert Kahn Scholarship for University Scholars in the College of Education
 Academic Excellence Scholarship
 2002 Frizzell Public Speaking Contest Award Winner

Professional Membership:

Pennsylvania State Education Association
 National Science Teachers Association
 Keystone State Reading Association